

從諷勸到剖白：論錢謙益〈呂留侯字說〉 兼述呂氏家難

（提要）

吳志廉

錢謙益（牧齋，1582–1664）為呂留良（晚村，1629–1683）改字而寫的〈呂留侯字說〉蘊含隱微寓意，容易被學界忽視，有深究價值。本文箋釋該文，考證文獻，拆解「張良故事」在明清之際被挪用轉化而成的「易代故事」，脈絡化地組織串聯出文本內外的呂氏家難與牧齋心境，以更深廣的視野為此文的詮釋提供一個可能性。本文首先印證錢牧齋筆下的呂氏家難，揭示呂晚村家族抗清事件與張良抗秦歷史有相似之處。牧齋〈呂留侯字說〉藉著張良此一「古典」與晚村此一「今事」之交錯契合，兼具對晚村「暗示名不副實」與「勸勉名實相符」的雙重寓意。牧齋曲筆諷勸晚村，觸發內心隱痛，遂在文中切換主體位置剖白。此外，牧齋入清前提及張良，肯定其之所以成功的「人事」因素；入清後淪為降臣，某些時刻提及張良則顧左右而言他，或有意無意地將其成功歸因於「天命」因素，旨在寬慰罪咎心靈，減輕精神苦痛，發出一種我非「千古幸人」張良的曲折自辯。本文調度史學材料之外，亦藉著細讀詩文等文學材料以剖析人心，冀能在主流的成見下發現裂縫，抉發因曲折筆法而被遮蔽的細節，呈現明清易代兩大失節者在出處進退所面臨的困境。

關鍵詞： 明清之際 呂留侯字說 錢謙益 呂留良

A Study of Qian Qianyi's "Lü Liuhou Zi Shuo"

(Abstract)

NG Chi Lim

Qian Qianyi's (Muzhai, 1582–1664) "Lü Liuhou zi shuo," an article on the courtesy name he bestowed upon Lü Liuliang (Wancun, 1629–1683), is a subtle and nuanced work that has often been neglected by the academia. This study aims to provide a possible interpretation of the article based on a close reading of its text and an analysis of the relevant literature. This paper begins with an examination of Qian's description of the Lü family's loss, thus revealing the similarities between Lü's resistance against the Qing imperial regime and Zhang Liang's resistance against the Qin rule. In drawing a parallel between his contemporary and the past, Qian provides "Lü Liuhou zi shuo" with dual connotations: implying that Lü's reputation is undeserved, and exhorting him to live up to the expectations that underline the bestowed courtesy name, "Liuhou." The article also triggers in Qian a dull heartache and, as the narrative progresses, the subject eventually switches from Wancun to Qian himself to express his own feelings, as his tactful advice to Lü evokes his long-buried sorrow. With an analysis of relevant historical literature, this paper concludes that Qian originally attributed Zhang Liang's success to personal factors, but, after his surrender to the Qing court, Qian changed his position and considered destiny as the main factor instead. This can be seen as a way for Qian to defend himself and reconcile with his guilt and distress. In addition to historical materials, this paper also explores Lü and Qian's thoughts by drawing on literary texts, such as poems and prose, to shed light on the dilemma faced by these two literati figures during the Ming-Qing transition.

Keywords: Ming-Qing transition Lü Liuhou zi shuo Qian Qianyi Lü Liuliang