

# MMAT5390: Mathematical Image Processing

## Solutions to Chapter 4 Exercises

$$1. H_i = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix}, H_{ii} = \begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \end{pmatrix},$$

$$H_{iii} = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & \frac{16}{17} & \frac{1}{2} & \frac{16}{17} \\ \frac{16}{17} & \frac{4}{5} & \frac{16}{41} & \frac{4}{5} \\ \frac{1}{2} & \frac{16}{41} & \frac{1}{5} & \frac{16}{41} \\ \frac{16}{17} & \frac{4}{5} & \frac{16}{41} & \frac{4}{5} \end{pmatrix}, H_{iv} = \begin{pmatrix} 0 & \frac{1}{17} & \frac{1}{2} & \frac{1}{17} \\ \frac{1}{17} & \frac{1}{5} & \frac{25}{41} & \frac{1}{17} \\ \frac{1}{2} & \frac{25}{41} & \frac{4}{5} & \frac{25}{41} \\ \frac{1}{17} & \frac{1}{5} & \frac{25}{41} & \frac{1}{17} \end{pmatrix},$$

$$H_v = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & e^{-\frac{1}{8}} & e^{-\frac{1}{2}} & e^{-\frac{1}{8}} \\ e^{-\frac{1}{8}} & e^{-\frac{1}{4}} & e^{-\frac{5}{8}} & e^{-\frac{1}{4}} \\ e^{-\frac{1}{2}} & e^{-\frac{5}{8}} & e^{-1} & e^{-\frac{5}{8}} \\ e^{-\frac{1}{8}} & e^{-\frac{1}{4}} & e^{-\frac{5}{8}} & e^{-\frac{1}{4}} \end{pmatrix}, H_{vi} = \begin{pmatrix} 0 & 1 - e^{-\frac{1}{8}} & 1 - e^{-\frac{1}{2}} & 1 - e^{-\frac{1}{8}} \\ 1 - e^{-\frac{1}{8}} & 1 - e^{-\frac{1}{4}} & 1 - e^{-\frac{5}{8}} & 1 - e^{-\frac{1}{4}} \\ 1 - e^{-\frac{1}{2}} & 1 - e^{-\frac{5}{8}} & 1 - e^{-1} & 1 - e^{-\frac{5}{8}} \\ 1 - e^{-\frac{1}{8}} & 1 - e^{-\frac{1}{4}} & 1 - e^{-\frac{5}{8}} & 1 - e^{-\frac{1}{4}} \end{pmatrix}.$$

(a)

$$\begin{aligned} DFT(f_1) &= \frac{1}{16} \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & -j & -1 & j \\ 1 & -1 & 1 & -1 \\ 1 & j & -1 & -j \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & -j & -1 & j \\ 1 & -1 & 1 & -1 \\ 1 & j & -1 & -j \end{pmatrix} \\ &= \frac{1}{16} \begin{pmatrix} 4 & 4 & 4 & 4 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & -j & -1 & j \\ 1 & -1 & 1 & -1 \\ 1 & j & -1 & -j \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix}. \end{aligned}$$

i,iii,v.

$$\tilde{f}_1 = \text{Re}(iDFT(DFT(f_1))) = f_1.$$

ii,iv,vi.

$$\tilde{f}_1 = \text{Re}(iDFT(\mathbf{0})) = \mathbf{0}.$$

(b)

$$\begin{aligned} DFT(f_2) &= \frac{1}{16} \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & -j & -1 & j \\ 1 & -1 & 1 & -1 \\ 1 & j & -1 & -j \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 1 & -1 & 1 & -1 \\ -1 & 1 & -1 & 1 \\ 1 & -1 & 1 & -1 \\ -1 & 1 & -1 & 1 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & -j & -1 & j \\ 1 & -1 & 1 & -1 \\ 1 & j & -1 & -j \end{pmatrix} \\ &= \frac{1}{16} \begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 4 & -4 & 4 & -4 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & -j & -1 & j \\ 1 & -1 & 1 & -1 \\ 1 & j & -1 & -j \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix}. \end{aligned}$$

i.

$$\tilde{f}_2 = \text{Re}(iDFT(\mathbf{0})) = \mathbf{0}.$$

ii.

$$\tilde{f}_2 = \text{Re}(iDFT(DFT(f_2))) = f_2.$$

iii.

$$\tilde{f}_2 = \text{Re}(iDFT(\frac{1}{5}DFT(f_2))) = \frac{1}{5}f_2.$$

iv.

$$\tilde{f}_2 = \text{Re}(iDFT(\frac{4}{5}DFT(f_2))) = \frac{4}{5}f_2.$$

v.

$$\tilde{f}_2 = \text{Re}(iDFT(e^{-1}DFT(f_2))) = e^{-1}f_2.$$

vi.

$$\tilde{f}_2 = \text{Re}(iDFT((1 - e^{-1})DFT(f_2))) = (1 - e^{-1})f_2.$$

(c)

$$\begin{aligned} DFT(f_3) &= \frac{1}{16} \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & -j & -1 & j \\ 1 & -1 & 1 & -1 \\ 1 & j & -1 & -j \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & -j & -1 & j \\ 1 & -1 & 1 & -1 \\ 1 & j & -1 & -j \end{pmatrix} \\ &= \frac{1}{16} \begin{pmatrix} 0 & 2 & 2 & 0 \\ 0 & -1-j & -1-j & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & -1+j & -1+j & 0 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & -j & -1 & j \\ 1 & -1 & 1 & -1 \\ 1 & j & -1 & -j \end{pmatrix} \\ &= \frac{1}{16} \begin{pmatrix} 4 & -2-2j & 0 & -2+2j \\ -2-2j & 2j & 0 & 2 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ -2+2j & 2 & 0 & -2j \end{pmatrix}. \end{aligned}$$

i.

$$\tilde{f}_3 = iDFT(DFT(f_3)) = f_3.$$

ii.

$$\tilde{f}_3 = iDFT(\mathbf{0}) = \mathbf{0}.$$

iii.

$$\begin{aligned} \tilde{f}_3 &= \frac{1}{16} \text{Re}(iDFT \left( \begin{pmatrix} 4 & -\frac{32}{17}(1+j) & 0 & \frac{32}{17}(-1+j) \\ -\frac{32}{17}(1+j) & \frac{8}{5}j & 0 & \frac{8}{5} \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ \frac{32}{17}(-1+j) & \frac{8}{5} & 0 & -\frac{8}{5}j \end{pmatrix} \right)) \\ &= \frac{1}{16} \text{Re} \left( \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & j & -1 & -j \\ 1 & -1 & 1 & -1 \\ 1 & -j & -1 & j \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 4 & -\frac{32}{17}(1+j) & 0 & \frac{32}{17}(-1+j) \\ -\frac{32}{17}(1+j) & \frac{8}{5}j & 0 & \frac{8}{5} \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ \frac{32}{17}(-1+j) & \frac{8}{5} & 0 & -\frac{8}{5}j \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & j & -1 & -j \\ 1 & -1 & 1 & -1 \\ 1 & -j & -1 & j \end{pmatrix} \right) \\ &= \frac{1}{340} \begin{pmatrix} -7 & 17 & 17 & -7 \\ 17 & 313 & 313 & 17 \\ 17 & 313 & 313 & 17 \\ -7 & 17 & 17 & -7 \end{pmatrix}. \end{aligned}$$

iv.

$$\begin{aligned} \tilde{f}_3 &= \begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix} - \frac{1}{340} \begin{pmatrix} -7 & 17 & 17 & -7 \\ 17 & 313 & 313 & 17 \\ 17 & 313 & 313 & 17 \\ -7 & 17 & 17 & -7 \end{pmatrix} \\ &= \frac{1}{340} \begin{pmatrix} 7 & -17 & -17 & 7 \\ -17 & 27 & 27 & -17 \\ -17 & 27 & 27 & -17 \\ 7 & -17 & -17 & 7 \end{pmatrix}. \end{aligned}$$

v.

$$\begin{aligned} \tilde{f}_3 &= \frac{1}{16} \text{Re}(iDFT \left( \begin{pmatrix} 4 & -2e^{-\frac{1}{8}}(1+j) & 0 & 2e^{-\frac{1}{8}}(-1+j) \\ -2e^{-\frac{1}{8}}(1+j) & 2e^{-\frac{1}{4}}j & 0 & 2e^{-\frac{1}{4}} \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 2e^{-\frac{1}{8}}(-1+j) & 2e^{-\frac{1}{4}} & 0 & -2e^{-\frac{1}{4}}j \end{pmatrix} \right)) \\ &\approx \begin{pmatrix} 0.0035 & 0.0553 & 0.0553 & 0.0035 \\ 0.0553 & 0.8859 & 0.8859 & 0.0553 \\ 0.0553 & 0.8859 & 0.8859 & 0.0553 \\ 0.0035 & 0.0553 & 0.0553 & 0.0035 \end{pmatrix}. \end{aligned}$$

vi.

$$\begin{aligned}\tilde{f}_3 &\approx \begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix} - \begin{pmatrix} 0.0035 & 0.0553 & 0.0553 & 0.0035 \\ 0.0553 & 0.8859 & 0.8859 & 0.0553 \\ 0.0553 & 0.8859 & 0.8859 & 0.0553 \\ 0.0035 & 0.0553 & 0.0553 & 0.0035 \end{pmatrix} \\ &= \begin{pmatrix} -0.0035 & -0.0553 & -0.0553 & -0.0035 \\ -0.0553 & 0.1141 & 0.1141 & -0.0553 \\ -0.0553 & 0.1141 & 0.1141 & -0.0553 \\ -0.0035 & -0.0553 & -0.0553 & -0.0035 \end{pmatrix}\end{aligned}$$

2. (a) Since  $M \geq 6$  and  $N \geq 8$ ,  $D(1, 2) = 5$ ,  $D(3, 1) = 10$  and  $D(2, 4) = 20$ .  
Since  $3H_1(1, 2) = 4H_1(3, 1) = 6H_1(2, 4)$ ,

$$\frac{3D_0^{2n}}{D_0^{2n} + 5^n} = \frac{4D_0^{2n}}{D_0^{2n} + 10^n} = \frac{6D_0^{2n}}{D_0^{2n} + 20^n}.$$

Since  $D_0 > 0$ ,

$$\begin{cases} 3(D_0^{2n} + 10^n) &= 4(D_0^{2n} + 5^n), \\ 4(D_0^{2n} + 20^n) &= 6(D_0^{2n} + 10^n), \end{cases}$$

which gives

$$\begin{cases} D_0^{2n} &= 3 \cdot 10^n - 4 \cdot 5^n = 5^n(3 \cdot 2^n - 4), \\ 2D_0^{2n} &= 4 \cdot 20^n - 6 \cdot 10^n \implies D_0^{2n} = 2 \cdot 20^n - 3 \cdot 10^n = 5^n(2 \cdot 2^{2n} - 3 \cdot 2^n). \end{cases}$$

Hence  $3 \cdot 2^n - 4 = 2 \cdot 2^{2n} - 3 \cdot 2^n$ , and thus  $(2^n - 1)(2^n - 2) = 0$  and  $n = 0$  or  $1$ .

If  $n = 0$ , then  $1 = D_0^{2 \times 0} = 5^0(3 \cdot 2^0 - 4) = -1$ . Contradiction.

Hence  $n = 1$ . Since  $D_0^2 = 5(3 \cdot 2 - 4)$ ,  $D_0 = \sqrt{10}$ .

- (b) Since  $M \geq 2c > 2a$  and  $N \geq 4c$ ,  $D(a, b) = a^2 + b^2 = c^2$  and  $D(0, 2c) = 4c^2$ .

Given  $H_2(a, b) = 8H_2(0, 2c)$ , i.e.  $e^{-\frac{c^2}{2\sigma^2}} = 8e^{-\frac{2c^2}{\sigma^2}}$ .

Hence  $e^{-\frac{c^2}{2\sigma^2}}(2e^{-\frac{c^2}{2\sigma^2}} - 1)(4e^{-\frac{c^2}{\sigma^2}} + 2e^{-\frac{c^2}{2\sigma^2}} + 1) = 0$ .

Thus  $e^{-\frac{c^2}{2\sigma^2}} = \frac{1}{2}$ ;  $-\frac{c^2}{2\sigma^2} = -\ln 2$  and thus  $\sigma = \frac{c}{\sqrt{2 \ln 2}}$ .

- (c) Since  $M = N = 10$ ,  $D(2, 7) = 2^2 + 3^2 = 13$  and  $D(5, 1) = 5^2 + 1^2 = 26$ .

Given  $H_3(2, 7) = \frac{1}{3}$  and  $H_3(5, 1) = \frac{4}{5}$ , i.e.

$$\begin{cases} \frac{13^n}{D_0^{2n} + 13^n} &= \frac{1}{3}, \\ \frac{26^n}{D_0^{2n} + 26^n} &= \frac{4}{5}. \end{cases}$$

Then  $D_0^{2n} = 2 \cdot 13^n$  and  $4D_0^{2n} = 26^n$ , and thus  $4 = 2^{n-1}$ .

Hence  $n = 3$ ; then  $D_0^6 = D_0^{2n} = 2 \cdot 13^3 = 2 \cdot 13^3$ , and thus  $D_0 = \sqrt[6]{2 \cdot 13^3}$ .

3. Recall that for any  $f \in M_{M \times N}(\mathbb{R})$ ,  $DFT(h * f)(u, v) = MN DFT(h)(u, v)DFT(f)(u, v)$ ;  
hence  $H(u, v) = MN DFT(h)(u, v)$ .

(a)

$$\begin{aligned}H_1(u, v) &= \sum_{x=-k}^k \sum_{y=-k}^k \frac{1}{(2k+1)^2} e^{-2\pi j(\frac{ux}{M} + \frac{vy}{N})} = \frac{1}{(2k+1)^2} \sum_{x=-k}^k e^{-2\pi j \frac{ux}{M}} \sum_{y=-k}^k e^{-2\pi j \frac{vy}{N}} \\ &= \frac{1}{(2k+1)^2} \left[ 1 + 2 \sum_{x=1}^k \cos \frac{2\pi ux}{M} \right] \left[ 1 + 2 \sum_{y=1}^k \cos \frac{2\pi vy}{N} \right].\end{aligned}$$

- (b)  $H_2(u, v) = \frac{r}{r+4} + \frac{1}{r+4} (e^{-2\pi j \frac{u}{M}} + e^{2\pi j \frac{u}{M}} + e^{-2\pi j \frac{v}{N}} + e^{2\pi j \frac{v}{N}}) = \frac{r+2(\cos \frac{2\pi u}{M} + \cos \frac{2\pi v}{N})}{r+4}$ .

(c)

$$\begin{aligned}
H_3(u, v) &= \frac{1}{4} + \frac{1}{8}(e^{-2\pi j \frac{u}{M}} + e^{2\pi j \frac{u}{M}} + e^{-2\pi j \frac{v}{N}} + e^{2\pi j \frac{v}{N}}) \\
&\quad + \frac{1}{16}(e^{-2\pi j(\frac{u}{M} + \frac{v}{N})} + e^{-2\pi j(\frac{u}{M} - \frac{v}{N})} + e^{-2\pi j(-\frac{u}{M} + \frac{v}{N})} + e^{-2\pi j(-\frac{u}{M} - \frac{v}{N})}) \\
&= \frac{1}{4} + \frac{1}{4}(\cos \frac{2\pi u}{M} + \cos \frac{2\pi v}{N}) + \frac{1}{4} \cos \frac{2\pi u}{M} \cos \frac{2\pi v}{N} \\
&= \frac{1}{4}(\cos \frac{2\pi u}{M} + 1)(\cos \frac{2\pi v}{N} + 1) \\
&= \cos^2 \frac{\pi u}{M} \cos^2 \frac{\pi v}{N}.
\end{aligned}$$

(d)

$$\begin{aligned}
H_4(u, v) &= -4 + e^{-2\pi j \frac{u}{M}} + e^{2\pi j \frac{u}{M}} + e^{-2\pi j \frac{v}{N}} + e^{2\pi j \frac{v}{N}} \\
&= -4 + 2 \cos \frac{2\pi u}{M} + 2 \cos \frac{2\pi v}{N} \\
&= -4(\sin^2 \frac{\pi u}{M} + \sin^2 \frac{\pi v}{N}).
\end{aligned}$$

(e)

$$\begin{aligned}
H_5(u, v) &= \frac{1}{T} \sum_{t=0}^{T-1} e^{-2\pi j(\frac{atu}{M} + \frac{btv}{N})} \\
&= \begin{cases} \frac{1}{T} \cdot \frac{1 - e^{-2\pi j T(\frac{au}{M} + \frac{bv}{N})}}{1 - e^{-2\pi j(\frac{au}{M} + \frac{bv}{N})}} & \text{if } \frac{au}{M} + \frac{bv}{N} \notin \mathbb{Z}, \\ 1 & \text{otherwise,} \end{cases} \\
&= \begin{cases} \frac{1}{T} e^{-\pi j(T-1)(\frac{au}{M} + \frac{bv}{N})} \frac{e^{\pi j T(\frac{au}{M} + \frac{bv}{N})} - e^{-\pi j T(\frac{au}{M} + \frac{bv}{N})}}{e^{\pi j(\frac{au}{M} + \frac{bv}{N})} - e^{-\pi j(\frac{au}{M} + \frac{bv}{N})}} & \text{if } \frac{au}{M} + \frac{bv}{N} \notin \mathbb{Z}, \\ 1 & \text{otherwise,} \end{cases} \\
&= \begin{cases} \frac{1}{T} e^{-\pi j(T-1)(\frac{au}{M} + \frac{bv}{N})} \frac{\sin(\pi T(\frac{au}{M} + \frac{bv}{N}))}{\sin(\pi(\frac{au}{M} + \frac{bv}{N}))} & \text{if } \frac{au}{M} + \frac{bv}{N} \notin \mathbb{Z}, \\ 1 & \text{otherwise.} \end{cases}
\end{aligned}$$

4. To be supplemented.

5.

$$\begin{aligned}
&\sum_{m=0}^{M-1} \sum_{n=0}^{N-1} F(m, n) \overline{F(m, n)} \\
&= \frac{1}{M^2 N^2} \sum_{m=0}^{M-1} \sum_{n=0}^{N-1} \sum_{k=0}^{M-1} \sum_{l=0}^{N-1} f(k, l) e^{-2\pi j(\frac{mk}{M} + \frac{nl}{N})} \sum_{k'=0}^{M-1} \sum_{l'=0}^{N-1} \overline{f(k', l')} e^{2\pi j(\frac{m k'}{M} + \frac{n l'}{N})} \\
&= \frac{1}{M^2 N^2} \sum_{m, k, k'=0}^{M-1} \sum_{n, l, l'=0}^{N-1} f(k, l) \overline{f(k', l')} e^{2\pi j(\frac{m(k'-k)}{M} + \frac{n(l'-l)}{N})} \\
&= \frac{1}{M^2 N^2} \sum_{k, k'=0}^{M-1} \sum_{l, l'=0}^{N-1} f(k, l) \overline{f(k', l')} \cdot M \mathbf{1}_{M\mathbb{Z}}(k' - k) \cdot N \mathbf{1}_{N\mathbb{Z}}(l' - l) \\
&= \frac{1}{MN} \sum_{k=0}^{M-1} \sum_{l=0}^{N-1} |f(k, l)|^2.
\end{aligned}$$

6. (a) Let  $f$  be a minimizer of  $\|L\vec{f}\|_F^2$  over all  $\{\varphi \in M_{M \times N}(\mathbb{R}) : \|\vec{g} - D\vec{f}\|_2^2 = \varepsilon\}$ . Then the method of Lagrange multipliers states that  $f$  necessarily minimizes the following Lagrangian:

$$\mathcal{L}(f) = \|L\vec{f}\|_F^2 + \lambda \|\vec{g} - D\vec{f}\|_2^2.$$

Hence  $\frac{d\mathcal{L}}{d\vec{f}} = 0$ , i.e.

$$\frac{d}{d\vec{f}}[\vec{f}^T L^T L f + \lambda(\vec{g}^T - \vec{f}^T D^T)(\vec{g} - Df)] = 0,$$

which gives  $2L^T L \vec{f} + \lambda(-2D^T \vec{g} + 2D^T D \vec{f}) = 0$  and thus  $(\lambda D^T D + L^T L) \vec{f} = \lambda D^T \vec{g}$ .

(b) i. For any  $x, y \in \{0, 1, \dots, M-1\}$ ,

$$\begin{aligned} (\sqrt{M}U_M)(\sqrt{M}U_M)(x, y) &= M \sum_{k=0}^{M-1} U_M(x, k) \overline{U_M(k, y)} = \frac{1}{M} \sum_{k=0}^{M-1} e^{2\pi j \frac{k(y-x)}{M}} \\ &= \frac{1}{M} \cdot M \delta(y-x) = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if } x = y, \\ 0 & \text{otherwise.} \end{cases} \end{aligned}$$

Hence  $\sqrt{M}U_M$  is unitary.

ii. Note that the  $(k, l)$ -th block of  $U \otimes V$ , denoted here by  $(U \otimes V)_{k,l}$ , is given by  $U(k, l)V$ . Hence the  $(k, l)$ -th block of  $(U \otimes V)^*$  is given by

$$[(U \otimes V)^*]_{k,l} = [(U \otimes V)_{l,k}]^* = \overline{U(l, k)} V^* = U^*(k, l) V^*.$$

Hence for any  $k, l \in \{0, 1, \dots, N\}$ ,

$$\begin{aligned} [(U \otimes V)(U \otimes V)^*]_{k,l} &= \sum_{n=0}^{N-1} (U \otimes V)_{k,n} [(U \otimes V)^*]_{n,l} \\ &= \sum_{n=0}^{N-1} U(k, n) U^*(n, l) V V^* \\ &= \delta(k-l) I_M. \end{aligned}$$

Hence  $U \otimes V$  is unitary.

iii. For any  $k, l \in \{0, 1, \dots, M\}$ ,

$$\begin{aligned} U_M C \overline{U_M}(k, l) &= \sum_{m=0}^{M-1} U_M(k, m) (C \overline{U_M})(m, l) \\ &= \sum_{m=0}^{M-1} \sum_{n=0}^{M-1} U_M(k, m) c_{m-n} \overline{U_M}(n, l) \\ &= \frac{1}{M^2} \sum_{m=0}^{M-1} \sum_{n=0}^{M-1} c_{m-n} e^{2\pi j \frac{ln-mk}{M}} \\ &= \frac{1}{M^2} \sum_{m=0}^{M-1} \sum_{n'=m-M+1}^m c_{n'} e^{2\pi j \frac{l(m-n')-mk}{M}} \\ &= \frac{1}{M^2} \sum_{n'=0}^{M-1} c_{n'} e^{-2\pi j \frac{ln'}{M}} \sum_{m=0}^{M-1} e^{2\pi j \frac{m(l-k)}{M}} \\ &= \frac{1}{M} \sum_{n=0}^{M-1} c_n e^{-2\pi j \frac{ln}{M}} \delta(l-k). \end{aligned}$$

Hence  $U_M C \overline{U_M}$  is diagonal.

Since  $\sqrt{M}U_M$  is unitary,  $U_M^{-1} = MU_M^* = M\overline{U_M}$ , and thus  $MU_M C \overline{U_M}$  is a diagonalization of  $C$ . Hence the eigenvalues of  $C$  are given by the diagonal entries of  $MU_M C \overline{U_M}$ :

$$\lambda_l(C) = \sum_{n=0}^{M-1} c_n e^{-2\pi j \frac{ln}{M}}, \quad l = 0, 1, \dots, M-1.$$

- iv. For any  $k, l \in \{0, 1, \dots, N-1\}$ , the  $(k, l)$ -th block of  $(U_N \otimes U_M)D(\overline{U_N} \otimes \overline{U_M})$ , denoted here by  $[(U_N \otimes U_M)D(\overline{U_N} \otimes \overline{U_M})]_{k,l}$ , is given by:

$$\begin{aligned}
[(U_N \otimes U_M)D(\overline{U_N} \otimes \overline{U_M})]_{k,l} &= \sum_{m=0}^{N-1} (U_N \otimes U_M)_{k,m} [D(\overline{U_N} \otimes \overline{U_M})]_{m,l} \\
&= \sum_{m=0}^{N-1} (U_N \otimes U_M)_{k,m} \sum_{n=0}^{N-1} D_{m-n}(\overline{U_N} \otimes \overline{U_M})_{n,l} \\
&= \sum_{m=0}^{N-1} \sum_{n=0}^{N-1} U_N(k, m) \overline{U_N(n, l)} U_M D_{m-n} \overline{U_M} \\
&= \frac{1}{N^2} \sum_{m=0}^{N-1} \sum_{n=0}^{N-1} e^{2\pi j \frac{ln-km}{N}} U_M D_{m-n} \overline{U_M} \\
&= \frac{1}{N^2} \sum_{m=0}^{N-1} \sum_{n'=m-N+1}^m e^{2\pi j \frac{l(m-n')-km}{N}} U_M D_{n'} \overline{U_M} \\
&= \frac{1}{N^2} \sum_{m=0}^{N-1} e^{2\pi j \frac{m(l-k)}{N}} \sum_{n'=0}^{N-1} e^{-2\pi j \frac{ln'}{N}} U_M D_{n'} \overline{U_M} \\
&= \frac{1}{N} \delta(l-k) \sum_{n'=0}^{N-1} e^{-2\pi j \frac{ln'}{N}} U_M D_{n'} \overline{U_M}.
\end{aligned}$$

Since  $D$  is block-circulant,  $D_{n'}$  is circulant. Hence by the result of (b)iii.,  $U_M D_{n'} \overline{U_M}$  is diagonal and thus  $(U_N \otimes U_M)D(\overline{U_N} \otimes \overline{U_M})$  is diagonal.

Since  $\sqrt{N}U_N$  and  $\sqrt{M}U_M$  are unitary,  $\sqrt{MN}U_N \otimes U_M$  is unitary, and  $MN(U_N \otimes U_M)D(\overline{U_N} \otimes \overline{U_M})$  is a diagonalization of  $D$ . The eigenvalues of  $D$  are the diagonal entries of  $MN(U_N \otimes U_M)D(\overline{U_N} \otimes \overline{U_M})$ , i.e.

$$\lambda_i(D) = \sum_{m=0}^{M-1} \sum_{n=0}^{N-1} D_{n,m} e^{-2\pi j (\frac{km}{M} + \frac{ln}{N})}, \quad k \in \{0, 1, \dots, M-1\}, \quad l \in \{0, 1, \dots, N-1\},$$

where  $D_{n,m}$  denotes the value of the entries on the diagonal of  $D_n$  with indices  $\{(x, y) : x - y \in m + M\mathbb{Z}\}$ .

- (c) i. For any  $x, y \in \{0, 1, \dots, M-1\}$ ,

$$\begin{aligned}
W_M D_{k-l} \overline{W_M}(x, y) &= \sum_{s=0}^{M-1} W_M(x, s) [D_{k-l} \overline{W_M}](s, y) \\
&= \sum_{s=0}^{M-1} W_M(x, s) \sum_{t=0}^{M-1} D_{k-l}(s, t) \overline{W_M}(t, y) \\
&= \frac{1}{M} \sum_{s=0}^{M-1} \sum_{t=0}^{M-1} D_{k-l, s-t} e^{2\pi j \frac{sx-ty}{M}} \\
&= \frac{1}{M} \sum_{s=0}^{M-1} \sum_{t'=s-M+1}^s D_{k-l, t'} e^{2\pi j \frac{sx-(s-t')y}{M}} \\
&= \frac{1}{M} \sum_{s=0}^{M-1} e^{2\pi j \frac{s(x-y)}{M}} \sum_{t'=0}^{M-1} D_{k-l, t'} e^{2\pi j \frac{t'y}{M}} \\
&= \begin{cases} \sum_{m=0}^{M-1} D_{k-l, m} e^{2\pi j \frac{my}{M}} & \text{if } x = y, \\ 0 & \text{otherwise.} \end{cases}
\end{aligned}$$

ii. For any  $k, l \in \mathbb{Z} \cap [0, N - 1]$ ,

$$\begin{aligned}
[(W_N \otimes W_M)D(\overline{W_N} \otimes \overline{W_M})]_{k,l} &= \sum_{m=0}^{N-1} (W_N \otimes W_M)_{k,m} [D(\overline{W_N} \otimes \overline{W_M})]_{m,l} \\
&= \sum_{m=0}^{N-1} (W_N \otimes W_M)_{k,m} \sum_{n=0}^{N-1} D_{m-n}(\overline{W_N} \otimes \overline{W_M})_{n,l} \\
&= \sum_{m=0}^{N-1} \sum_{n=0}^{N-1} W_N(k, m) \overline{W_N(n, l)} W_M D_{m-n} \overline{W_M} \\
&= \frac{1}{N} \sum_{m=0}^{N-1} \sum_{n=0}^{N-1} e^{2\pi j \frac{km-ln}{N}} W_M D_{m-n} \overline{W_M} \\
&= \frac{1}{N} \sum_{m=0}^{N-1} \sum_{n'=0}^{N-1} e^{2\pi j \frac{km-l(m-n')}{N}} W_M D_{n'} \overline{W_M} \\
&= \frac{1}{N} \sum_{m=0}^{N-1} e^{2\pi j \frac{m(k-l)}{N}} \sum_{n'=0}^{N-1} e^{2\pi j \frac{ln'}{N}} W_M D_{n'} \overline{W_M} \\
&= \delta(k-l) \sum_{n=0}^{N-1} e^{2\pi j \frac{ln}{N}} W_M D_n \overline{W_M}.
\end{aligned}$$

Hence for any  $k, l \in \{0, 1, \dots, N - 1\}$  and  $x, y \in \{0, 1, \dots, M - 1\}$ ,

$$\begin{aligned}
&[(W_N \otimes W_M)D(\overline{W_N} \otimes \overline{W_M})](x + kM, y + lM) \\
&= [(W_N \otimes W_M)D(\overline{W_N} \otimes \overline{W_M})]_{k,l}(x, y) \\
&= \begin{cases} \sum_{n=0}^{N-1} e^{2\pi j \frac{ln}{N}} [W_M D_n \overline{W_M}](x, y) & \text{if } k = l, \\ 0 & \text{otherwise,} \end{cases} \\
&= \begin{cases} \sum_{n=0}^{N-1} e^{2\pi j \frac{ln}{N}} \sum_{m=0}^{M-1} D_{n,m} e^{2\pi j \frac{mx}{M}} & \text{if } k = l \text{ and } x = y, \\ 0 & \text{otherwise,} \end{cases} \\
&= \begin{cases} \sum_{m=0}^{M-1} \sum_{n=0}^{N-1} D(m + nM, 0) e^{2\pi j (\frac{mx}{M} + \frac{ln}{N})} & \text{if } k = l \text{ and } x = y, \\ 0 & \text{otherwise,} \end{cases} \\
&= \begin{cases} \sum_{m=0}^{M-1} \sum_{n=0}^{N-1} h(m, n) e^{2\pi j (\frac{mx}{M} + \frac{kn}{N})} & \text{if } k = l \text{ and } x = y, \\ 0 & \text{otherwise,} \end{cases} \\
&= \begin{cases} MN \overline{DFT}(h)(x, k) & \text{if } k = l \text{ and } x = y, \\ 0 & \text{otherwise.} \end{cases}
\end{aligned}$$

(d) For any  $x \in \{0, 1, \dots, M - 1\}$  and  $y \in \{0, 1, \dots, N - 1\}$ , and  $f \in M_{M \times N}(\mathbb{R})$ ,

$$\begin{aligned}
[(W_N \otimes W_M)\mathcal{S}(f)](x + yM) &= \sum_{m=0}^{M-1} \sum_{n=0}^{N-1} (W_N \otimes W_M)(x + yM, m + nM) \mathcal{S}(f)(m + nM) \\
&= \sum_{m=0}^{M-1} \sum_{n=0}^{N-1} W_N(y, n) W_M(x, m) f(m, n) \\
&= \frac{1}{\sqrt{MN}} \sum_{m=0}^{M-1} \sum_{n=0}^{N-1} f(m, n) e^{2\pi j (\frac{mx}{M} + \frac{ny}{N})} \\
&= \sqrt{MN} \left[ \frac{1}{MN} \sum_{m=0}^{M-1} \sum_{n=0}^{N-1} f(m, n) e^{-2\pi j (\frac{mx}{M} + \frac{ny}{N})} \right] \\
&= \sqrt{MN} \overline{DFT}(f)(x, y)
\end{aligned}$$

$$= \sqrt{MN} \overline{\mathcal{S}(DFT(f))}(x + yM).$$

Hence  $(W_N \otimes W_M)\mathcal{S}(f) = \sqrt{MN}\mathcal{S}(\overline{DFT(f)})$ .

(e) Recall the result from (a):

$$(\lambda D^T D + L^T L)\vec{f} = \lambda D^T \vec{g}.$$

Since  $D$  and  $L$  are block-circulant, the result from (c)ii. asserts that

$$[(W_N \otimes W_M)D(\overline{W_N} \otimes \overline{W_M})](x+kM, y+lM) = \begin{cases} MN \overline{DFT(h)}(x, k) & \text{if } k = l \text{ and } x = y, \\ 0 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases};$$

equivalently, denoting the  $MN \times MN$  diagonal matrix by  $\Lambda_D$ ,

$$D = (\overline{W_N} \otimes \overline{W_M})\Lambda_D(W_N \otimes W_M).$$

Similarly,

$$L = (\overline{W_N} \otimes \overline{W_M})\Lambda_L(W_N \otimes W_M).$$

Hence

$$\begin{aligned} (\lambda D^T D + L^T L)\vec{f} &= (\lambda D^* D + L^* L)\vec{f} \\ &= \{\lambda[(\overline{W_N} \otimes \overline{W_M})\Lambda_D(W_N \otimes W_M)]^*(\overline{W_N} \otimes \overline{W_M})\Lambda_D(W_N \otimes W_M) \\ &\quad + [(\overline{W_N} \otimes \overline{W_M})\Lambda_L(W_N \otimes W_M)]^*(\overline{W_N} \otimes \overline{W_M})\Lambda_L(W_N \otimes W_M)\}\vec{f} \\ &= [\lambda(W_N \otimes W_M)^*\Lambda_D^*\Lambda_D(W_N \otimes W_M) + (W_N \otimes W_M)^*\Lambda_L^*\Lambda_L(W_N \otimes W_M)]\vec{f} \\ &= (\overline{W_N} \otimes \overline{W_M})(\lambda\Lambda_D^*\Lambda_D + \Lambda_L^*\Lambda_L)(W_N \otimes W_M)\vec{f} \\ &= (\overline{W_N} \otimes \overline{W_M})(\lambda\Lambda_D^*\Lambda_D + \Lambda_L^*\Lambda_L)\sqrt{MN}\mathcal{S}(\overline{DFT(f)}); \end{aligned}$$

on the other hand,

$$\begin{aligned} \lambda D^T \vec{g} &= \lambda D^* \vec{g} \\ &= \lambda(W_N \otimes W_M)^*\Lambda_D^*(\overline{W_N} \otimes \overline{W_M})^* \vec{g} \\ &= \lambda(\overline{W_N} \otimes \overline{W_M})\Lambda_D^*(W_N \otimes W_M)\vec{g} \\ &= \lambda(\overline{W_N} \otimes \overline{W_M})\Lambda_D^*\sqrt{MN}\mathcal{S}(\overline{DFT(g)}). \end{aligned}$$

Hence  $(\lambda\Lambda_D^*\Lambda_D + \Lambda_L^*\Lambda_L)\mathcal{S}(\overline{DFT(f)}) = \lambda\Lambda_D^*\mathcal{S}(\overline{DFT(g)})$ . By comparing each pair of entries,

$$(\lambda M^2 N^2 |DFT(h)(u, v)|^2 + M^2 N^2 |DFT(p)(u, v)|^2) \overline{DFT(f)}(u, v) = \lambda MN DFT(h)(u, v) \overline{DFT(g)}(u, v),$$

which yields

$$DFT(f)(u, v) = \frac{\lambda \overline{DFT(h)}(u, v) DFT(g)(u, v)}{MN(\lambda |DFT(h)(u, v)|^2 + |DFT(p)(u, v)|^2)}.$$

7. To be supplemented.

8. To be supplemented.