

Drugs, Destiny, and Disease in Medieval China: Situating Knowledge in Context*

Michael Stanley-Baker

Abstract

This paper examines the therapeutic use of drugs and ritual as recorded in a 4th-century scripture and the ways different notions of destiny affected treatment. It also offers methodological considerations of the ways contemporary scholarship has separated medicine and religion as discrete fields in early imperial China, and proposes methods for closer engagement with these early materials. A standing theory in the field argues that because rituals of confession and therapeutic drugs were understood to operate on different principles, these two interventions were mutually exclusive. Confessional rituals relied on a moral accounting system and manipulated one's "count" of allotted life, whereas drugs simply worked empirically, and therefore disrupted the ritual accounting system.

The author investigates this theory by reading the *Zhen'gao* 真誥 (DZ 1016), as an ethnographic source, one of the best of the period. It was also an important source used by proponents of the argument outlined above. Comparison of different revelations indicates that, contrary to the above

Michael Stanley-Baker is Post-Doctoral Fellow jointly at the Max Planck Institute for the History of Science and at the Berlin Center for the History of Knowledge.

* My thanks go to reviewers of this paper in earlier forms: Terry Kleeman, Stephen Bokenkamp, Catherine Despeux, Johnathan Pettit, Vivienne Lo, and Pierce Salguero. Chang Chaojan 張超然 patiently and generously read the *Zhen'gao* with me over many months. Dolly Yang helped edit the abstract. Funding for the research leading up to this paper was provided by the Wellcome Trust and the Chiang Ching-kuo Foundation. Institutional support was provided by Academia Sinica, the Needham Institute, and the Max Planck Institute for the History of Science.

findings, drugs and ritual were used together over time to treat the same people with the same complaints in what appears to have been a regular protocol. The paper further describes an etiological theory in the text that connects a causal chain that crosses various domains, including ritual and drug therapy. This section of the paper concludes that the hard separation of religion and medicine imagined in earlier scholarship deserves to be re-examined on the basis of actor categories.

How did the protagonists of the *Zhen'gao* actually organize their knowledge in practice? Looking beyond theoretical models of disease and cure, this organization is visible in the ways social and institutional practice structured the flow and hierarchy of knowledge. Rather than distinguishing between the ritual and the empirical, the protagonists of the text placed much more emphasis on differentiating the esoteric from the exoteric, secret knowledge intended only for initiates versus that circulated to the laity. Very clear distinctions mark these as two different methods of transmission, treatment styles, medical cultures and notions of disease.

A concluding methodological reflection argues that attention to the situatedness of knowledge is useful for tracing the emergence of stable systems, whether religious or medical. It argues that this method reveals a two-level notion of destiny as a critical distinguishing feature of Shangqing knowledge.

Keywords: Shangqing, medicine, religion, drugs, destiny

The story is set in the Buckle-bent Hills (Gouqu shan 句曲山) outside of Jiankang 建康 (modern day Nanjing) in the late 4th century. The detailed transcriptions preserved in Tao Hongjing's 陶弘景 (456–546) *Declarations of the Perfected* (*Zhen'gao* 真誥, DZ 1016) record the visions, dialogues, letters, diaries and ritual petitions which circulated between ca. 373 and 370 among the southern gentry family of Xu Mi 許謐 (303–?), and his two sons Xu Hui 許翮 (341–ca. 370) and Xu Lian 許聯 (328–404).¹ The majority

¹ The dates of some portions of the *Zhen'gao* may be much earlier, in particular *j.* 5. On the transmission of the manuscripts, most recently see Feng Lihua 馮利華, “*Zhen'gao* banben kaoshu” 《真誥》版本考述, *Guji zhengli yanjiu xuekan* 古籍整理研究學刊 4 (2006): 29–34. References to texts in the *Daoist Canon* (*Zhengtong daoze* 正統道藏) use the DZ code to refer to their index numbers in Kristofer Marinus Schipper, *Concordance du Tao-Tsang: titres des ouvrages* (Paris: Ecole française d'Extrême-Orient, 1975).

of this corpus consists of revelations bestowed upon their attendant priest (*jijiu* 祭酒) and revelatory medium Yang Xi 楊羲 (330–386?) by the Perfected (*zhenren* 真人), ascended masters of the Upper Clarity 上清 heaven.² These revelations contained divine knowledge

² The scholarship on this text and the family is extensive, as the precise dating of the revelations has made them an important resource for dating scriptures and hence the patterns of emergence of the Daoist religion. Seminal early works on the sect and major actors are Michel Strickmann, *Le Taoïsme du Mao Chan: chronique d'une révélation* (Paris: Collège de France, 1981); Michel Strickmann, "The Alchemy of T'ao Hung-ching," in *Facets of Taoism: Essays in Chinese Religion*, ed. Holmes Welch and Anna K. Seidel (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1979), 123–92; Michel Strickmann, "The Mao Shan Revelations: Taoism and the Aristocracy," *T'oung Pao* 63.1 (1977): 1–64. The foundational summary and dating of surviving scriptures from the primary and secondary Shangqing canon is Isabelle Robinet, *La révélation du Shangqing dans l'histoire du taoïsme* (Paris: Ecole française d'Extrême-Orient, 1984), 2 vols. She further articulates in detail the nuanced textures of the early Shangqing revelations and visualization practice in Isabelle Robinet, *Taoist Meditation: The Mao-shan Tradition of Great Purity*, trans. Julian F. Pas and Norman J. Girardot (Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 1993). Landmark studies from Japan are Ishii Masako 石井昌子, *Dōkyōgaku no kenkyū: Tō Kōkei o chūshin ni* 道教學の研究: 陶弘景を中心に (Tokyo: Kokusho kankōkai, 1980); Yoshikawa Tadao 吉川忠夫, *Rikuchō Dōkyō no kenkyū* 六朝道教の研究 (Tokyo: Shunjūsha, 1998); Kamitsuka Yoshiko 神塚淑子, *Rikuchō Dōkyō shisō no kenkyū* 六朝道教思想の研究 (Tokyo: Sōbunsha, 1999). The critical translation of the *Zhen'gao* into modern Japanese remains the single most useful research tool for its study: Yoshikawa Tadao et al., eds., *Shinkō kenkyū: Yakuchū hen* 真誥研究: 譯注篇 (Kyoto: Kyoto daigaku jinbun kagaku kenkyūjo, 2000). All translations in this paper consult this work. A translation of the first four *juan* into English has also just been released: Tao Hongjing, *Declarations of the Perfected. Part One, Setting Scripts and Images into Motion*, trans. Thomas E. Smith (St. Petersburg, Florida: Three Pines Press, 2013); see the review of this work in the current issue of this Journal, 376–382. Works that describe the therapeutic practices of the early Shangqing community are described below. The current state-of-the-art in Shangqing studies, both for its rigorous philological criticism, and for being the first to propose a chronological sequence of the revelations is Chang Chaojan, "Xipu, jiaofa ji qi zhenghe: Dongjin Nanchao Daojiao Shangqing jingpai de jichu yanjiu" 系譜・教法及其整合: 東晉南朝道教上清經派的基礎研究 (PhD diss., Taipei: National Chengchi University, 2007). The first chapter may be consulted for a more in-depth review of the scholarship on Shangqing Daoism. His earlier survey of Shangqing visualization practice should also be taken into account: "Liuchao Daojiao Shangqing jingpai cunsi fa yanjiu" 六朝道教上清經派存思法研究 (MA thesis, Taipei: National Chengchi University, 1999). The instrumental reference work providing access to major historiographical moments in Daoist Studies is *The Encyclopedia of Taoism*, ed. Fabrizio Pregadio (London: Routledge, 2008), 2 vols.

about the bureaucratic structure of the afterlife, embodied practices to attain high rank in its institutions, as well as advice, consolation, and encouragement for spiritual practice. An important content of these revelations, for the Xus and their close friends and relatives, was therapeutic advice—the revelations prescribed a broad array of different curative practices, including drug recipes, massages, visualization exercises, acupuncture and moxibustion (*zhen* 針, *jiu* 灸), talismans (*fu* 符), incantations (*song* 誦), confessions (*xieguo* 謝過) and petitions (*zou* 奏).

Each of these practices could be found among the repertoires of different healers in the region, and served in different ways as markers of the epistemological terrain in which members of the Shangqing community sought to locate their own specific repertoire as unique, effective, and superior to others.³ These therapeutic practices were not neutral knowledge; they identified the Shangqing gods, and their followers, as possessing special knowledge that gave access to rarefied heavenly realms. This knowledge was disseminated in various ways to different individuals, defining in each instance a particular relationship between those who revealed, transmitted, and received this knowledge. The transmission and use of this knowledge established a clearly defined structure of the community—who were its members, where were they located within it, and who was excluded, to hover at its periphery with more or less distance. Building on the scholarly consensus that the possession, transmission, and practice of knowledge was a fundamental feature of Daoist society,⁴ in this paper I consider the complex networks of relations that emerged around and structured therapeutic knowledge.

³ This is argued more fully in Michael Stanley-Baker, “Daoists and Doctors: The Role of Medicine in Six Dynasties Shangqing Daoism” (PhD diss., London: University College London, 2013).

⁴ Sivin cites Michel Strickmann, “Taoism in the Lettered Society of the Six Dynasties” (paper presented at the Second International Conference on Taoist Studies, Tateshima, Japan, 1972), as one of the earliest examples in Western Daoist Studies of the emphasis on scriptural transmission: Nathan Sivin, “On the Word ‘Taoist’ as a Source of Perplexity: With Special Reference to the Relations of Science and Religion in Traditional China,” *History of Religions* 17.3/4 (1978): 306.

This emphasis on social forms as produced, in part, by technical practice, stands in contrast to earlier studies of Daoist drug use. Paul Unschuld argued that the social values of specific communities determined and delimited their use of medical technologies.⁵ The group he labelled “Daoist” was, he argued, a sector of society who lived on the social and geographic periphery, and whose rugged mountain lives made them more amenable to the physical skills of drug foraging, collection, and preparation.⁶ (This description refers to “*xianren*” 仙人, now translated in Daoist studies as “Transcendents.”) He further argued that, because drug therapy worked empirically, regardless of one’s moral status, drugs’ therapeutic powers constituted a threat to the moral etiologies that undergirded confessional rituals of Celestial Master (Tianshi 天師) and Great Peace (Taiping 太平) Daoism.⁷ These Daoist etiologies explain the source of disease as moral fault, either of the patient, of his or her family, or in some cases, the state. The weight of this fault is calculated by numinous beings inhabiting the bureaucratic structure of the afterlife, and punishment is then visited on the living.⁸

Unschuld argued that the material effects of drugs in curing disease led to their being used as an escape from this moral system, a way to get “off the books.”⁹ He considered that drugs were

⁵ Paul U. Unschuld, *Medicine in China: A History of Ideas* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1985).

⁶ *Ibid.*, 101–16.

⁷ *Ibid.*, 117–131, and “When Health was Freed from Fate: Some Thoughts on the Liberating Potential of Early Chinese Medicine,” *East Asian Science, Technology, and Medicine* 31 (2010): 11–24.

⁸ On Taiping confessional rites and etiological conceptions, see Barbara Hendrischke, “Religious Ethics in the *Taiping jing*: The Seeking of Life,” *Daoism: Religion, History and Society* 4 (2012): 53–94; Barbara Hendrischke, *The Scripture on Great Peace: The Taiping jing and the Beginnings of Daoism* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2006), 141–52; Barbara Hendrischke, “The Concept of Inherited Evil,” *East Asian History* 2 (1991): 1–30.

⁹ For a broad repertoire of ways in which people sought to escape the moral calculus of religions in the Han dynasty and later, see: Robert Ford Campney, “Living off the Books: Fifty Ways to Dodge *Ming* in Early Medieval China,” in *The Magnitude of Ming: Command, Allotment, and Fate in Chinese Culture*, ed. Christopher Lupke (Honolulu: University of Hawai‘i Press, 2005), 129–50; Stephen R. Bokenkamp, “Simple Twists of Fate: The Daoist Body and Its *Ming*”

thought to grant moral license, obviating the moral strictures on personal behavior that were thought to guarantee health, and opening the road to a form of individualism not available in other therapeutic systems. Drawing on Strickmann's foundational research on Shangqing Daoism, he argued that confessional rituals and drug therapy were never used together.¹⁰ "Daoists" categorically did not rely on confessional rituals because they eschewed the economy of morals on which they relied and "cast aside the constraining girdle of proper social *tenue* (*yidai* 遺帶)."

Strickmann went on to make a more nuanced argument roughly in concert with Unschuld's thesis. He maintained that there was a distinction between drug and ritual therapy, and that the early Shangqing community recognized this, but argued that the syncretically-minded sect used both kinds of treatment, just that they were used to treat different diseases. He therefore argued that rather than distinguishing between different *communities*, the different properties of drugs and ritual were used to treat different *etiologies*:

To synthesize Taoism with their inherited drug culture, it appears that the first generation of Mao Shan adepts tried to establish a distinction between ailments with a moral etiology and those caused purely by accident, negligence, or chance. Amoral afflictions that were not the result of just retribution by the celestial record keepers or of vengeance from the spirits of the dead were susceptible to treatment by ordinary secular medicine and pharmacology.¹¹

in *The Magnitude of Ming*, 151–65; Ursula-Angelika Cedzich, "Corpse Deliverance, Substitute Bodies, Name Change, and Feigned Death: Aspects of Metamorphosis and Immortality in Early Medieval China," *Journal of Chinese Religions* 29 (2001): 1–68. Notably the majority of methods addressed in these studies do not use drugs, but rather methods to falsify one's identity or request that one's fate be recalculated.

¹⁰ Paul U. Unschuld, *Medicine in China: A History of Pharmaceuticals* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1986), 28–30, citing Strickmann, "The Alchemy of T'ao Hung-ching," 137. Notably, this citation from Strickmann is based on his study of the *Zhen'gao*.

¹¹ Michel Strickmann, *Chinese Magical Medicine*, ed. Bernard Faure (Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 2002), 49. Li Jianmin argued more recently, also on the basis of Tao Hongjing's writings, that two different etiological theories were significant features of Six Dynasties therapeutics, but did not argue

Not only did the early Shangqing community use both drugs and ritual to cure disease, they also regularly combined them in a systematic treatment strategy. This is important because it offers a perspective on the formation of Medicine and Religion as discrete social and technical institutions, and the practices by which they were distinguished as such. Unschuld's concern was to distinguish medicine as a discrete institution through the history of ideas. Strickmann's *Chinese Magical Medicine* performs an overview of a broad eclectica of therapeutic practices, but being a posthumously published work, the overriding critical agenda was not as clearly formulated. However, visible in the passage cited above is the influence of his former work formulating a working concept of the formation of Daoism as a distinct and recognizable entity.¹² My goal here is rather, without prejudice to notions of medicine, healing, religion, or Daoism, to privilege the epistemic and institutional distinctions used by early actors, and to observe the emergence of processes by which they distinguished their systems of knowledge. The approaches used in this micro-study speak to the broader, more recent scholarship on Daoism and medicine in medieval China.¹³

Another feature was more important to the Shangqing community for distinguishing and organizing their therapies. This distinction separated two different types of planning in relationship to destiny and the degree to which it could be changed. It separated

that these were used to distinguish communities, or to distinguish between patients and their cases. Li Jianmin 李建民, "They shall Expel Demons: Etiology, the Medical Canon and the Transformation of Medical Techniques before the Tang," in *Early Chinese Religion. Part I: Shang through Han (1250 BC–220 AD)*, ed. John Lagerwey and Marc Kalinowski (Leiden; Boston: Brill, 2009), 2:1103–1150.

¹² Strickmann's most explicit statement about the formation of Daoism is in his "History, Anthropology, and Chinese Religion," *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies* 40.1 (1980): 201–248.

¹³ Representative works by authors who write on this subject are Gai Jianmin 蓋建民, *Daojiao yixue 道教醫學* (Beijing: Zongjiao wenhua chubanshe, 2001); Lin Fushih 林富士, *Zhongguo zhonggu shiqi de zongjiao yu yiliao 中國中古時期的宗教與醫療* (Taipei: Lianjing, 2008); Livia Kohn, *Chinese Healing Exercises: The Tradition of Daoyin* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2008); and Sakade Yoshinobu 坂出祥伸, *Taoism, Medicine and Qi in China and Japan* (Osaka: Kansai University Press, 2007).

aspirants from laypeople, and common knowledge from esoteric secrets; it was mirrored in social structure, textual organization, the scale and duration of treatment, and the expectations of cure. In these two sets of plans, the contrast between empiricism and morality and spiritual power held no epistemological or socially organizing force. These different relationships to destiny changed the way that knowledge was transmitted, disease was conceived, and the types of treatments prescribed. They constituted, in effect, discrete ontologies of disease and destiny. I refer to them as Curative Prescriptions and Cultivation Regimes.

Given that the *Zhen'gao* is one of, if not the best, ethnographic records we have from the early imperial period, we can then understand it as in some way representative of broader drug culture. With qualifications, we can learn from this example and begin to come to a broader understanding of the flows of drug knowledge within a variety of communities in China at this time. While the examples described here are specific and local, the methodological proposals laid out at the end of this paper are considered to have wider applications.

I. The Social Contours of Shangqing Drug Lore: Curative Prescriptions for the Laity and Cultivation Regimes for Initiates

In addition to initiating members of the Shangqing sect into long-term practice regimes, oriented towards bodily- and self-perfection, the Shangqing gods revealed therapeutic drugs, or recipes to make them, to the broader, non-initiate community of friends and family. This more diffuse circulation affected the knowledge revealed, changing how we should understand Shangqing therapeutics and also how the medium Yang Xi and his patrons, the Xus, intersected with the broader network of healers in the region. In this section, I discuss three recipes, each of which was prescribed in response to specific disease conditions outside the framework of self-cultivation.

Shangqing recipes did not vary in the way that the renowned doctor Zhang Zhongjing 張仲景 changed his recipes, for example, adding or subtracting elements from base formulae according to the

physiological and etiological profile presented in each case.¹⁴ There is no evidence the recipes were modified from a basic form to suit individual constitutions.¹⁵ They do however, vary in transmission—some recipes recorded in hagiographies are then slightly changed when discussed in the *Zhen'gao*. Different recipes were prescribed for different conditions; the basic approach is thus closer to early *fang* 方 (recipe) literature where little or no consideration for recipe alteration is included in the recipes.

In contrast to the relatively static nature of the recipes themselves, the contexts in which they were prescribed did vary, and tell us a great deal about the situational thinking involved in giving prescriptions: considerations include the person's status within the sect, age, state of health, and stage of cultivation. The recipes can be usefully divided into two major categories, which I borrow from Hsieh Tsung-hui and Xiao Dengfu, but to which I give the terms Curative Prescriptions and Cultivation Regimes.¹⁶

¹⁴ From the basis of core sets of drugs, Zhang recommended adapting those formulas according to changing patient conditions which signified progress of the disease. The most widely acclaimed translation of Zhang Zhongjing's *Shanghan lun* 傷寒論 is *Shang han lun: On Cold Damage*, trans. Craig Mitchell et al. (Brookline, MA: Paradigm Publications, 1999). On the reception of the *Shanghan lun* in Chinese medical circles, see Asaf Moshe Goldschmidt, *The Evolution of Chinese Medicine: Song Dynasty, 960–1200* (London; New York: Routledge, 2009). On recensions of this text in the Dunhuang collections, see Donald Harper, "Précis de connaissance médicale: Le *Shanghan lun* 傷寒論 (Traité des atteintes par le froid) et le *Wuzang lun* 五臟論 (Traité des cinq viscères)," in *Médecine, religion et société dans la Chine médiévale: étude de manuscrits chinois de Dunhuang et de Turfan*, ed. Catherine Despeux (Paris: Collège de France–Institut des hautes études chinoises, 2010), 1:65–106.

¹⁵ The salient point that Ge Hong 葛洪 (284–343/363) did not modify dosages of transcendent drugs for individual constitutions, as contrasted to his near contemporary Huangfu Mi 皇甫謐 (214/215–282) is made in Frederick Shih-chung Chen, "Ge Hong and the Development of Chinese Medicine" (MA thesis, London: School of Oriental and African Studies, 2002).

¹⁶ Hsieh Tsung-hui 謝聰輝, "Tao Hongjing *Zhen'gao* yishu zai Zhongguo yiyaoxue shi de gongxian" 陶弘景《真誥》一書在中國醫藥學史的貢獻, *Chuantong yixue zazhi* 傳統醫學雜誌 13 (2002): 19–28; Hsieh Tsung-hui, "*Zhen'gao* de bencao yiliao guan yanjiu" 《真誥》的本草醫療觀研究 (paper presented at the "Diyijie quanguo Daojiaoxue lunwen fabiaohui" 第一屆全國道教學論文發表會, Hsinchu: Hsuan Chuang University, May 2002); Xiao Dengfu 蕭登福, "Tao Hongjing *Zhen'gao* zhong suojian xiuzhen zhibing yaofang ji zhongsong guizhu shuo" 陶

The first category of prescriptions refers to recipes that focused specifically on curing disease, and which circulated outside of an explicit context of cultivation. These drugs were prescribed within the context of a consultation wherein simples and compounds were chosen for their suitability to treat specific disease conditions. The Perfected responded to requests by the Xus and people in their wider social network to address entirely pragmatic concerns. This network was not limited to initiates seeking spiritual transcendence, but extended to a wider community of friends, mothers, and children. These formulas are also found in wider medical literature from later periods.

The second category, regimes, refers to recipes prescribed as part of a scaled set of practices intended to advance practitioners on their way to the status of a Perfected, a biospiritually changed being with superior social status, rank in the celestial bureaucracy, and residency in astral or fabled locations. They were to be taken habitually for longer periods, from a hundred days to five years or more. These regimes or regimens organized empirical observations about practitioners' relative states of health, the efficacy of different practices, and ideas about best practice for combining them, and preserved this knowledge across generations of practitioners. Their presence in hagiographies raises further the question of their status as restricted formulas (*jinfang* 禁方) and the degree to which they circulated only within the circle of Shangqing initiates, or more broadly within the community.¹⁷

These two categories, prescription and regime, are heuristic. Cultivation Regime recipes were effective against disease, and

弘景《真誥》中所見修真治病藥方及塚訟鬼注說 (paper presented at the “Guoji daoxue yu sixiang wenhua xueshu yantaohui” 國際道學與思想文化學術研討會, Xiamen: Xiamen University, April 2005). Xiao uses a number of identical passages and very similar arguments to Hsieh's papers, but does not cite either. Unfortunately, my copies of these papers are electronic word documents, either from the authors or from online blogs. Pagination for these citations corresponds to the electronic documents.

¹⁷ On restricted formulae, one of the most thorough reviews is Li Jianmin, “Zhongguo gudai ‘jinfang’ kaolun” 中國古代「禁方」考論, in *Shengming shixue: Cong yiliao kan zhongguo lishi* 生命史學：從醫療看中國歷史 (Taipei: Sanmin shuju, 2005), 149–206.

figures prescribing them took into account individual conditions such as age, illness, and physical stamina. The categories refer as much to the contexts in which they were transmitted as they do to the recipes and their physiological functions. These contexts played an important role in determining what could and could not be transmitted. The regime implies a long-term relationship of mentorship, care, and, importantly, initiation. Esoteric recipes did not circulate into the broader community. The secrecy of these recipes augmented their power and authority. By contrast, prescriptions were dispensed as favors, along social networks conditioned by a gift economy, in a temporal arc that ended with the resolution of the disease. The dispensers could be recompensed by payment for ritual services, and they often combined drug and ritual therapies.

(a) A Phlegm Recipe for Xu Mi

One example of a curative recipe is a prescription put together for Xu Mi, who is described at numerous points in the *Zhen'gao* as suffering from phlegm-damp syndrome (*tanyin* 痰飲), a condition which induces sluggishness, torpor, poor digestion, and weakness of the muscles. One of the recipes prescribed for him was called Five Phlegm Pills (*wuyin wan* 五飲丸). These pills worked, as their name implies, to dispel phlegm from the body. The formula does not appear in Shangqing hagiographies, and nowhere else in the received record until Sun Simiao's 孫思邈 (541/581–682) *Qianjin yaofang* 千金要方, presented in 650.¹⁸ Hsieh Tsung-hui argues that this absence from the record until then indicates that it was an esoteric recipe to which Sun had access because he was a Shangqing Daoist. I argue below that its appearance in the *Qianjin yaofang* means it was available in the wider sphere, not subject to limited transmission, and should thus be considered an exoteric “prescription.”

¹⁸ Sun Simiao, *Beiji qianjin yaofang* 備急千金要方 (Taipei: Guoli zhongguo yiyao yanjiusuo, 1990), 18.334. A full translation of this recipe can be found in Michael Stanley-Baker, “Daoists and Doctors,” 299.

Firstly, Tao Hongjing tells us: “Five Phlegm Pills are just the ones we have today” 五飲丸即是世中者耳.¹⁹ Secondly, the recipe does not appear in hagiographies of the tradition and is not otherwise marked as special in the Shangqing literature. Thirdly, the formula of the same name in the received record is complex, using over thirty ingredients—much more than the recipes typically found in Daoist texts, which usually use only five or so.²⁰ As such, it more closely resembles the formulae of elite doctors criticized by Ge Hong—those with too many ingredients that made them hard to make and hard to find ingredients for.²¹ Finally, the title of the formula suggests a much more sophisticated etiological theory than is usually evident in Shangqing, transcendent, or Celestial Master texts from this period. Sun Simiao’s copy of the recipe indicates that the title refers to five types of phlegm distinguished according to their anatomical region: below the heart, in the flanks, in the stomach, above the diaphragm, and between the five organs, as well as in the intestines. These basic types are also found in Chao Yuanfang’s 巢元方 (fl. 605–616) *Zhubing yuanhou lun* 諸病源候論.²² Rather than suggesting, as Hsieh does, that this was a restricted Shangqing recipe, and that its use by the Xus is testament to their

¹⁹ *Zhen’gao*, 7.8a7.

²⁰ See, for example *Taishang Lingbao wufu xu* 太上靈寶五符序 (DZ 388), j. 2, and Shawn Arthur, *Early Daoist Dietary Practices: Examining Ways to Health and Longevity* (Lanham, MA: Lexington Books, 2013).

²¹ For discussion of class, access to complex medicine and prescriptive styles, see Michael Stanley-Baker, “Daoists and Doctors,” 154–161. Ge Hong complains of his contemporaries: “When treating sudden and violent symptoms, [these medical texts] all use expensive medicines, deploying dozens of kinds, so that if one is not from a wealthy house and living in the capital city, one cannot accumulate them, nor can one quickly buy them” 而治卒暴之候，皆用貴藥，動數十種，自非富室而居京都者，不能素儲，不可卒辦也。See Wang Ming 王明, *Baopuzi neipian jiaoshi* 抱朴子內篇校釋 (Taipei: Liren shuju, 1981), 15.248. Consulted: James R. Ware, trans., *Alchemy, Medicine, Religion in the China of A.D. 320: The Nei p’ien of Ko Hung (Pao-p’u tzu)* (Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press, 1967), 253–54. See citation and argument in Frederick Chen, “Ge Hong and the Development of Chinese Medicine.”

²² Reprinted as *Zhubing yuanhou lun jiaozhu* 諸病源候論校注, ed. Ding Guangdi 丁光迪 (Beijing: Renmin weisheng chubanshe, 1992), 20.598–607. Chao does not mention the formula, but includes the five types of phlegm, as well as others in his analysis.

pharmacological acumen, I suspect the use of this drug name in the *Zhen'gao* is the earliest attestation of complex phlegm theory, predating that in the received medical literature.

The availability of the recipes in the broader community raises questions about the material and economic culture involved in the revelations. There is good evidence that many people knew enough about preparing drugs to make their own. Numerous passages in the *Zhen'gao* discuss drug preparation in detail; the first two revelations concern Five Phlegm Pills, and the third is in reference to making Spirit Incipience Pills (for more on which, see below):

You ought to take Five Phlegm Pills; they disperse the *qi* of water-infusion. They should be made quickly.²³ They don't just cure disease; they can also stop white [hair] and restore your complexion.²⁴

宜服五飲丸，去水注之氣。可急合。不但治疾而已，亦以住白而有氣色也。

Mix the Five Phlegm Pills precisely, and you ought to gain great strength. Then won't you be able to rest at ease? These are the words of Fan Anyuan.²⁵

精合五飲丸，當大得力。且可自靜息乎？范安遠所言。

When mixing drugs you should ensure you are precise. Those who lack precision don't take responsibility themselves; they turn the blame on the formula as ineffective. What if people could admit their blame? Then we could just let them copy the recipes and mix them [themselves].²⁶

合藥當令精。不精者不自咎，反責方之不驗。若是人可謂咎乎？可使鈔方合耳。

²³ *Shinkō kenkyū*, 256, reads this clause to mean “you will quickly become whole”—an uncommon descriptor for a cure. However, in the next revelation Fan Anyuan uses the same verb “合” to refer to making pills. If this passage does mean making medicines quickly, then it would appear that the complex recipe in the *Qianjin yaofang* is not the same one referred to here.

²⁴ *Zhen'gao*, 7.8a4–7.

²⁵ *Ibid.*, 7.8a8–8b1.

²⁶ *Ibid.*, 10.3b6–8.

If the Xus used a recipe similar to the one we find in the *Qianjin yaofang*, then they would have needed a broad collection of drugs. Did they keep such a varied store available, could it all be locally sourced, or did they buy in from traders? Did they or their servants prepare these formulas themselves or did they write prescriptions to be filled in town? Letters between the Xus describe them preparing simpler recipes such as quick rice (see below), but about these more complex ones it is hard to say.

(b) A Pediatric Remedy for Kong Mo's Family

Another curative prescription is revealed in the *Zhen'gao*. It appears to have been given to Kong Mo 孔默, the brother of Kong Yan 孔嚴, a comrade-in-arms of Xu Mi's father.²⁷ Following Hsieh Tsung-hui, I reconstruct this prescription event over two revelations. In the first revelation, two divine beings reply to Kong Mo's request for medicine. The first speaker, the Transcendent who Settles the Records (Dinglu xianren 定錄仙人),²⁸ criticizes those who lack diligence in self-care, and opt for drug therapy as a way of avoiding responsibility for their own bodies. Then the Lord who Protects Life (Baoming jun 保命君)²⁹ recommends that Kong get some burial goods and perform burial rites to prevent disease by ghost infestation.

First Revelation³⁰

For those who have not yet harmonized their spirits, quieted their forms, or bowed their heads to nourish their dark and secret

²⁷ Tao Hongjing notes that Kong Yan served with Xu Mi's father in the supreme commander's vanguard under Yan's elder cousin Kong Tan 坦 during the campaign against Shen Chong 沈充 (d. 324). Tao surmises that due to this karmic tie (*yinyuan* 因緣) Kong was able to obtain revelations.

²⁸ Dinglu xianren is the official title of Mao Gu 茅固, the middle of the three Mao brothers who lived in the Han and then became chthonic gods of Mao shan.

²⁹ This is an alternate name for Mao Zhong 茅衷, the youngest of the three chthonic gods from the local region, the Lords of the Mao mountains. He frequently reveals information concerning health-related or self-cultivation practices or texts.

³⁰ *Zhen'gao*, 8.3a8–8.3b7; *Shinkō kenkyū*, 277. It could be argued that the utterances by the two different beings are in fact two separate revelations. Tao Hongjing appears to have thought them related, and to the same event, as he

essences,³¹ then the causes of disease accumulate over the years. If you are not yet able to use the method for repaying debt, why be so insistent in demanding drugs?

The Transcendent who Settles the Records responds to Kong's request for a drug recipe.

Think to bury your elder brother quickly; the present infestation miasmas will soon disperse. Even though they won't cause interference for the living, it is urgent that coffin goods should be acquired. This will calm the three springs and cause the noxious *qi* to disperse and calm down. The recipe for the child's illness will then be revealed.

On the night of the 5th month, 17th day. What Transcendent Lord who Protects Life said answered [Kong's] enquiries about a sick person.

自未得和神靜形，俯頭幽精者，疾源或與年而積耶。若未能用交賒之途者。將奚促促於藥？

定錄仙人答孔求乞藥方。

想早葬兄，今注煙速消。雖不辦妨於生者，要欲得樞物。時³²寧三泉，使凶氣浪靜也。小兒疾方行當示。

五月十七日夜，保命仙君所言答(孔)³³所問疾患者。

Kong Mo's disturbance had affected the family, who came to the Perfected for advice. Here he is denied any drug formulae, and disabused of such notions by the Transcendent who Settles the Records, who retorts that constantly seeking medicines without doing any internal cultivation or exercise is like poor banking

collected together one following the other. These two speeches come right after a revelation dated to the 14th of the fifth month, just three days before Mao Zhong's revelation. They may have been revealed on the same night.

³¹ I understand the use here to refer to an internal product of refining seminal essence. The only other use of dark and secret essence (*youjing* 幽精), in *Zhen'gao*, 6.2b4, refers to a product of alchemically refined cinnabar. Uses in other texts from this and later periods predominantly indicate one of three body gods, the other two of which are Iridescent Numen (*shuangling* 爽靈) and Embryonic Radiance (*taiguang* 胎光), later taken as names for the three cloudsouls (*sanhun* 三魂). The passage here does not indicate such a reading.

³² Reading “時” here as “是” or “寔.”

³³ Tao Hongjing notes a character has been excised, and posits that it is “孔.”

practice—his debts will eventually catch up with him. The Lord who Protects Life then advises Kong Mo to bury his brother quickly, saying that if he avoids the displeasure of the Yellow Springs, then the infusing miasmas (*zhuyan* 注煙) and noxious *qi* (*xiongqi* 凶氣) of the corpse would quickly disperse. Only then will a recipe for pediatric disease be revealed.

This passage draws on the disease idiom commonly referred to as ghost infusion (*guizhu* 鬼注), a notion that the celestial bureaucracy or the unquiet dead (whether family members or other spirits), caused ghostly vapors to be visited upon the living and manifest disease. Contrary to the thesis proposed by Unschuld and Strickmann, we see here drugs being used to resolve diseases associated with this type of spiritual retribution—there is no separation of “empirical” drugs from diseases caused by ghosts and spirits.

A second revelation may be followed-up from the one above, providing the pediatric remedy sought by Kong. This passage records two divine beings, the Lord who Protects Life whom we saw above, and the Lady of Purple Tenuity (*Ziwei furen* 紫微夫人).³⁴ An unknown person petitions for drug recipes, to which the Lady replies, “after some pause,” with a reference to a recipe already available “at this time” 世間自有. The propitiator should seek it out and use it in secret. The Lord who Protects Life then clarifies matters by asking whether or not the prescription is “one with ox gall and silver powder,” to which the Lady replies by nodding her head. Tao Hongjing, recognizing these ingredients, later identifies the formula as Great Mind-Calming Pills (*da zhenxin wan* 大鎮心丸), and comments on the difficult procedure of mixing silver ore into mercury:

³⁴ Purple Tenuity refers to the central area of the sky surrounding the North Pole, which from the Han dynasty on was considered to be the inner palace of the Celestial Emperor wherein he conducted domestic affairs. It is populated by various women of the imperial household. The Lady might therefore more properly be titled the Lady of the Royal Enclosure. One of the primary teachers of the Shangqing tradition, she frequently appears in the *Zhen'gao*, often revealing therapeutic or health-preserving methods and remedies.

Second Revelation³⁵

Then he made a formal inquiry: “Can I receive a prescription from you?” After some time she replied, “This is already available at this time. You can seek it, and then use it in secret.” The Lord who Protects Life asked the Lady, saying: “Does this formula use ox gall and silver powder or not? If so, then it’s a little difficult to make.”

The Lady of Purple Tenuity replied by simply nodding her head.

即啟：「可得疏方不？」良久，答言：「世間自有！可尋索密用。」保命君問紫微曰：「此方用牛黃、銀屑者非？若是者，小為難合。」

紫微答，但頷頭。

Tao Hongjing identifies this as a pediatric recipe in circulation in his time, the Great Mind-Calming Pill. He recognizes it on the basis of the use of ground silver in a quicksilver solution. Hsieh Tsung-hui argues that this second revelation was a response to Kong Mo’s request in the first revelation described above. Xiao Dengfu, on the other hand, maintains the propitiant in the second declaration is not known. Both, however, agree that the formula corresponds with that one of the same name in the *Qianjin yaofang*. There are three recipes with this name in the Tang Dynasty *Qianjin yaofang*, but only one uses silver ore mixed into mercury. This recipe is contained in the pediatric section, under methods for fits (*xian* 癩).³⁶ The author of the *Qianjin yaofang*, Sun Simiao considered one of these types of fit to originate from “fright” (*jing* 驚), a common diagnosis among temple healers even today.³⁷ Was this remedy administered for shock from the death of Kong Mo’s brother? The record can tell us no more.

³⁵ *Zhen’gao*, 8.4b1–5.

³⁶ *Qianjin yaofang*, 5.80. Although one common modern translation of *xian* is epilepsy, this etiology differs from native Chinese understandings. Chao Yuanfang describes “癩” as manifesting in children under 10, whereas in older children it is called *dian* 癩, sometimes translated as “falling disease.” It is characterized by the eyes and tongue drawing together, the eyeballs rolling upwards, flailing of the limbs, rigidity of the spine, turning of the neck. Its etiology was divided into three main causes: wind, fright, and diet. *Zhubing yuanhou lun*, 45.1273ff.

³⁷ Fright can be the result of all manner of events, including bereavement, as in the

However, close attention to the process of prescribing the formula tells a richer story about local encounters of health care, ritual, and comparative epistemology. The family was grieving a dead relative who had not yet been buried, and came to enquire about hygiene, preventative health measures, and ritual propriety. They were advised to bury the body quickly, to do so with sufficient materials to appease the Yellow Springs, and given recommendations of treatments for their health. Kong Mo's request for medicines was initially denied, and he was told that self-maintenance was preferable to relying on drugs. This recommendation refers to exercises, quiescence, breathing, and minor visualizations—a battery of which are included in *juan* 9 and 10 of the *Zhen'gao*. I understand this first revelation to be as much practical health advice as it was moral encouragement for the family to gird themselves up during this time of mourning. Dealing with the corpse was an immediate priority, as it was a source of disease transmissible by ghost-infusion. It was only once these immediate affairs settled down that the Perfected then turned the family's attention to the child.

The formula that may have been prescribed for the child in Kong Mo's family, outside the close circle of initiates, was available "in this generation." This means it was not a restricted recipe, and permissible to circulate within the broader network of Xu family associates. As we have seen, the prescription was complex, and probably took time, and was thus closer to the kinds of remedies characteristic of doctor's prescriptions.³⁸

The convergence of discourses about the corpse, the Yellow Springs, ritual propriety, and anxiety about disease is consistent with the widespread notion of contagious diseases as mediated by the disembodied spirits of the deceased.³⁹ The Xus were well aware

Kong family case. Remedies for fright are most commonly described in relation to children, but adults can also receive them and often do. Author's field observations, Taipei, Hsingyin, Tainan, Taichung between 1998 and 2010. Also see Arthur Kleinman, *Patients and Healers in the Context of Culture: An Exploration of the Borderland between Anthropology, Medicine and Psychiatry* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1980).

³⁸ See note 21 above on Ge Hong's characterization of doctor's recipes.

³⁹ The literature on notions of communicable disease through early medieval China

of the infectious properties of corpses, as “Corpse Disorder” featured in the medical writings of Xu Mi’s uncle by marriage, the renowned doctor and alchemical writer Ge Hong.⁴⁰

While the recipes that Ge Hong describes for ghost infestation were either dietary or emetic (producing vomiting), Yang Xi’s interventions responded to emotional, ritual, and hygienic dimensions of the corpse’s presence. Ritual burial was an important first response, especially in the heat of Jiangnan in June. The family members would have been anxious about corpse pollution, and fearful for their own safety, as well as suffering from the shock of the death. The burial rites also provided an opportunity to present

is extensive; it is perhaps one of the most central driving concerns in public and religious healthcare in the Six Dynasties. On the idiosyncratic actions of vengeful ghosts killed violently by war and improperly buried see Michel Strickmann, *Chinese Magical Medicine*, 25 passim. On more systematic notions of individual and corporate merit that were mediated through sepulchral lawsuits, see Peter Nickerson, “The *Great Petition for Sepulchral Complaints*,” in *Early Daoist Scriptures* by Stephen R. Bokenkamp, with a contribution by Peter Nickerson (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997), 230–60, and “Taoism, Death, and Bureaucracy in Early Medieval China” (PhD diss., Berkeley: University of California, Berkeley, 1996). On contemporary reincarnation debates about Buddhist notions concerning the transmission of souls from corpse to new host over successive transmissions, see Liu Lifu 劉立夫, “Liuchao xingshen zhi zheng” 六朝形神之爭, *Shijie Hongming zhexue jikan* 世界弘明哲學季刊 12 (2002), <http://harmonia.arts.cuhk.edu.hk/~cculture/library/hongming/200212-003.htm>, accessed 22 October 2014. An overview of ghost-based etiologies and the roles played in medical and Daoist literature, is Li Jianmin, “They shall Expel Demons.” T. J. Hinrichs traces a neat progression of increasingly conservative, non-spiritual notions of disease from these ideas through imperially sponsored writers such as Chao Yuanfang and Sun Simiao into the Song. See T. J. Hinrichs, “The Medical Transforming of Governance and Southern Customs in Song Dynasty China” (PhD diss., MA: Harvard University, 2003), and forthcoming monograph. On the development of the ideas of the related ideas of epidemic and communicable disease, in the context of the late Han and into the Six Dynasties, see Lin Fushih, “Zhongguo zhonggu shiqi de wenyi yu shehui” 中國中古時期的瘟疫與社會, and “Donghan shiqi de jiyi yu zongjiao” 東漢時期的疾疫與宗教, in *Zhongguo zhonggu shiqi de zongjiao yu yiliao*, 3–28 and 29–84.

⁴⁰ Ge Hong’s is one of, if not the earliest surviving description of disease transmission from corpses to the living: “After death, [corpse infestation (*shizhu* 尸注)] repeats the transmission to a person nearby, and leads to the destruction of the family line. When you detect its symptoms, you should urgently treat it” 死後，復傳之旁人，乃至滅門。覺知此候者，便宜急治之。 *Ge xianweng zhouhou beiji fang* 葛仙翁肘後備急方 (DZ 1306), 1.17a–b, translated in T. J. Hinrichs, “The Medical Transforming of Governance,” 173.

coffin goods to subterranean lictors who were otherwise hard to reach. This would likely have had economic repercussions for Yang Xi, who would probably profit from payments to spiritual aides in his service.⁴¹ As we shall see, it appears to be a pattern that therapeutic rituals were prescribed first, and then followed up with pharmacological interventions in subsequent consultations.

(c) Liu Zun's Mother

This pattern is more clearly evident in the following pair of successive revelations. We find again a pattern where requests are responded to first with rituals, and then with drug therapy. The drug prescribed then appears later in formularies more available to the broader public.

Left Deputy Liu Zun 劉遵 comes to ask about “demon-dissolvers” (*xiaomo* 消魔), that is, therapeutic drugs and exercises.⁴² He is at first mocked for not understanding what he was talking about; despite his research, he had not clarified his understanding, like digging a well but not then dredging the slurry. The Perfected, Lady Flower-of-the-Right (Youying furen 右英夫人), trades on his public reputation and gently mocks him for poor elocution.⁴³

⁴¹ We have no further evidence of how this particular instance would have played out, but his negotiations for payment for the services of spirits in another therapeutic ritual have been well studied. Stephen R. Bokenkamp, *Ancestors and Anxiety: Daoism and the Birth of Rebirth in China* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2007), 112–130.

⁴² At this period, “demon-dissolver” was a term that referred to medicine—where illness was perceived to be of demonic origin, and thus that drugs got rid of demons. Tao Hongjing’s note on this passage refers simply to drugs (*yao* 藥), but passages citing various *xiaomo* scriptures in *Zhen’gao*, j. 9 refer to therapeutic massage as well. Incantation of the *Xiaomo jing* 消魔經 also came to be considered effective against disease, although this scripture postdates the *Zhen’gao* by a hundred years or so. Isabelle Robinet, *La révélation*, 2:179–86.

⁴³ “Pure conversation” (*qingtan* 清談) was a treasured social skill at this time in Jiangnan, and an important means to make one’s way in society. Tao Hongjing notes that Liu was publicly known to be an inept conversationalist, citing a famous incident mentioned in *Shishuo xinyu* 世說新語, j. 25. The tale concerns one Liu Zunzu 劉遵祖, given name Liu Yuanzhi 劉爰之, an otherwise unattested figure. Tao appears to equate Liu Zun with Liu Zunzu because of the similar name and common topic of embarrassment concerning conversation skill. *Shinkō kenkyū*, 256, follows Tao’s equation. Tao notes: “Liu Zunzu was good at

Driving her point home with a slew of witty literary images that highlight his ineptitude, she then takes pity on his mother. She determines that the sickness was not a matter for “Demon dissolving” remedies, but one of addressing the Water Official (Shuiguan 水官), and she delegates Xu Mi to attend to his ritual needs:

First Revelation⁴⁴

[Liu] Zun is diligent and attentive in his worship, he has an affection for medicines, which is why he mentioned the curative powers of the *Demon-Dissolving [Scripture]*. This means he would like to hear about it and is asking for permission so to do.

If one ought to go south but runs north, then the heart and the mouth are at odds. [This is like] those who offer [sweet] shepherd’s purse in place of [bitter] sow thistle. As for he who smirks at the nine codas, but delights in Northern ditties, I know he has no ear for hearing harmonies.⁴⁵ You ought to be eternally fortunate, and this should

conversation. Yin Hao (303–356) recommended him to Yu Liang (289–340). At a later meeting, the conversation [between Yu and Liu] was particularly unsuitable, and accordingly Yu called him Yang Shuzi’s (221–278) crane instead. Thereupon he lost his [good] name” 劉遵祖善譚說，殷浩向庾亮稱之。後一會，談論殊不合，遂名之為羊叔子鶴，於是失名。The *Shishuo xinyu* goes on to explain that Yang Shuzi (given name Yang Hu 祐) once had a crane that could dance, but when guests came to the house it never would. Hence Yu’s name for Liu Zun. Liu Yiqing 劉義慶, *Shishuo xinyu jianshu* 世說新語箋疏, with notes by Yu Jiayi 余嘉錫 (Shanghai: Guji chubanshe, 1993), 25.812; Richard B. Mather, trans., *A New Account of Tales of the World: Shih-shuo hsün-yü*, 2nd ed. (Ann Arbor: Center for Chinese Studies University of Michigan, 2002), 453, 586. On pure conversation, see also Nanxiu Qian, *Spirit and Self in Medieval China: The Shih-shuo hsün-yü and Its Legacy* (Honolulu: University of Hawai’i Press, 2001); Yiming Tang, “The Voices of Wei-Jin Scholars: A Study of ‘qingtan’” (PhD diss., New York: Columbia University, 1991).

⁴⁴ *Zhen’gao*, 8.3b7–4a7.

⁴⁵ Tao notes that this passage draws on the following from *Baopuzi waipian* 抱朴子外篇 (DZ 1187), 38.17a7–9: “Those who present sow thistle as if artemisia, must have a mouth which does not know sweet. Those who discard jade and pick gravel, their intelligence must be unable to discriminate treasures. He who slights the nine codas but delights in Northern trash, I know he cannot discern the earth gods and worships the flying phoenixes [who come to attend the rites]” 捐茶茹蒿者，必無識甘之口。棄瓊拾礫者，必無甄珍之明。薄九成而悅北鄙者，吾知其不能格靈祇而儀翔鳳矣。 *Shang shu* 尚書, j. 5, from which the aphorism originally comes, describes phoenixes flying in to hear the coda of the rites: “籥韶九成，鳳凰來儀。”

extend to your poor mother. Well, the topic you've raised shows you've studied but not reflected on it, like digging a well but not dredging it; this one of those peccadilloes of you fleshy humans. What you are talking about is not this. The current matter is one of resolving the curse of the Water [Official], who seems to have more to say. Perhaps Secretary Xu can offer assistance within his chamber of silence; then [Liu's] household can be made whole. Moreover, when the master [Yang Xi] oversees the appropriate invitation by libation, then virtue and grace [will result].

On the 20th night of the 5th month, this was composed for the Grand Secretary by Lady Flower-on-the-right.

遵懃心香火，有情向藥，故有言《消磨》之愈疾。謂其將聞斯，而請命耶。

應南趨而北騁，既心口違矣，夫捐齋以茹荼，晒九成而悅北鄙者，我知其無識和音之聽鑒也。當永為吉人，爰及母奴。然所起是學而不思，浚井不渫，蓋肉人之小疵耳！無乃此也。今事結水禁，猶有可申。若許長史能於靜中若救之者，則一門全矣。亦是師主祭酒之宜請而為德惠乎。

五月二十日夜，右英作與長史。

Two months later, on the seventh of the seventh month, Liu Zun's persistence is rewarded. In a second revelation, translated below, he is praised for his dedication to cultivation, and Great Aspiration Pills (*da yuanzhi wan* 大遠志丸) are recommended for his mother:

Second Revelation⁴⁶

Liu Zun's mind is fixed only on cultivation. Why not have his mother take "Great Aspiration Pills?"

On the 7th of the 7th month, declared by Lady Wang of the Royal Palace Enclosure.

⁴⁶ *Zhen'gao*, 8.4a8-10.

劉遵心故為修耳！何不令其母服「大遠志丸」。

七月七日夜，紫微夫人告。

Comparing this consultation with the previous one surrounding Great Mind-Calming Pills reveals a pattern where ritual interventions are adopted as the first stage of response, and drugs are prescribed later. Xu Mi, in this instance, is asked to make ritual intercessions, overseen by Yang Xi. There is no record of what rituals were used, but Strickmann identifies two different therapeutic ritual confessions that the Xus used in treating themselves. The first is the “five days of communication,” which involved kneeling and confessing one’s own and one’s ancestors’ faults, and asking to be removed from the Black Register of the Three Officials. The second involved bringing down the stars of the dipper on different days into different organs, requesting them to expunge the adept’s faults and those of his or her ancestors.⁴⁷ A further confession in Xu Hui’s own hand is preserved in full in the *Zhen’gao*.⁴⁸ These are, however, rites performed by individuals for themselves—it is unclear to me at this point whether Xu Mi would have facilitated these exact rites when helping Liu Zun, or used other similar practices.

As with the previous compound drug, this revealed prescription can also be found in the *Qianjin yaofang*, where it is primarily recommended for post-partum depression (literally insufficiency due to post-partum heart vacuity [*chan hou xin xu bu zu* 產後心虛不足]), fuzzy-headedness (*huanghuang huhu* 恍恍惚惚), sudden abdominal pains, restless sleep, and dyspnea (breathlessness).⁴⁹ The Aspiration or will (*zhi* 志) in the title of the recipe refers to the psychological function of the kidneys, which are depleted when giving birth. The

⁴⁷ Michel Strickmann, *Chinese Magical Medicine*, 47, references *Ziyang zhenren neizhuan* 紫陽真人內傳 (DZ 303), 20a–25a, and *Jinque dijun sanyuan zhenyi jing* 金闕帝君三元真一經 (DZ 253, hereafter as *Sanyuan zhenyi jing*), 13b–end. See Robinet, *La révélation*, 2:51, 83.

⁴⁸ *Zhen’gao*, 7.12b–13a; *Shinkō kenkyū*, 264–65; translated in Stephen R. Bokenkamp, *Ancestors and Anxiety*, 146–47.

⁴⁹ *Qianjin yaofang*, 3.43.

primary herb is rehmannia, one of the most widely used kidney tonics in Chinese medicine. Because the herbs treat kidney deficiency, they would also be appropriate for older, post-menopausal women, such as the intended recipient in the *Zhen'gao*, Liu Zun's mother.⁵⁰

(d) Confluences between the Medical Body and the Spiritual World

There appears to be a further correspondence between the ritual and the drug diagnosis via five phase theory. Kidneys correspond to the phase of Water, as does their psychological aspect of will—the key term in the title of the recipe. Notably Liu Zun's mother's illness was diagnosed as a “curse by the Water[-Official]” 水(官)之禁.⁵¹

Correlations between spiritual etiologies and classical medical theory can be seen in other treatments in the *Zhen'gao*. A series of revelations are devoted to Xu Mi's *bi* 痺 or obstruction syndrome in the arm; Yang Xi interprets it as ensuing from a host of interrelated causes.⁵² The Lord who Protects Life draws together the disparate domains of personal illness, geomancy, afterlife bureaucracy, ghostly curses, and classical physiology in a single

⁵⁰ Although women's medicine had not appeared as a discrete field of knowledge at this time, it is possible this formula was known as a woman's drug, and represents diagnosis based on sexual differentiation. On women's medicine in China, see Charlotte Furth, *A Flourishing Yin: Gender in China's Medical History, 960–1665* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1998); Sabine Wilms trans., *Bèi Jí Qiān Jīn Yào Fāng: Essential Prescriptions Worth a Thousand in Gold for Every Emergency, 3 Volumes on Gynecology* (Portland: The Chinese Medicine Database, 2008); Lee Jen-der 李貞德, “Han Tang zhijian de nüxing yiliao zhaogu zhe” 漢唐之間的女性醫療照顧者, *Taida lishi xuebao* 臺大歷史學報 23 (1999): 123–56; Lee Jen-der, “Han Tang zhijian yifang zhong de jijian furen yu nüti wei yao” 漢唐之間醫方中的忌見婦人與女體為藥, *Xin shixue* 新史學 13.4 (2002): 1–35.

⁵¹ I concur with *Shinkō kenkyū*, 279b, reading of this passage that “官” should be interpolated here for “禁,” on the basis of the ritual prescription which follows.

⁵² See Michael Stanley-Baker, “Daoists and Doctors,” 76–109; Terry F. Kleeman, “The Ritualized Treatment of Stroke in Early Medieval Daoism and the Secret Incantation of the Northern Thearch,” in *Foundations of Daoist Ritual: A Berlin Symposium*, ed. Florian C. Reiter (Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 2009), 227–38.

etiology, and gives them a level of mutual coherence through the use of five-phase correspondence theory:

As for the production of Wind illnesses, they are born when the [burial] mounds and barrows are shaded and damp, when the Three Springs are clogged. It is for this reason that the Earth Officer strikes [a descendent] with water pneumas; most contract Wind Obstruction.⁵³

風病之所生，生於丘墳陰濕，三泉壅滯。是故地官以水氣相激，多作風痺。

Here, damp has entered the tomb of Xu Mi's wife, who then complains to the Earth Officer (Diguan 地官) in the underworld. The official sends a curse of watery *qi* (*shuiqi* 水氣) as punishment that, when it strikes Xu Mi's body, transforms into bone-obstruction due to damp. This pattern roughly corresponds to classical medical interpretations of *bi*-syndrome, to be found in the *Huangdi neijing* 黃帝內經, which identify obstruction as a coalescence of soil, cold, and wind.⁵⁴ According to the *Neijing*, different admixtures of these properties will cause the disease to become fixed in different parts of the body. Xu Mi's obstruction syndrome is a combination of soil (the tomb and the Earth Officer) that correlates with the flesh, water (dampness and watery *qi* curses) that correlates with the bones, and wind that correlates with the tendons. Yang Xi's etiology correlates with the classical five-phase definition of the illness, but is grounded in the causal operations of Celestial Master spiritual bureaucracy and mobilized by a moral calculus that underpins notions of ghost infusion. This correlation between classical medical theory and ritual logic can also be seen in the example above concerning Liu Zun's mother.

This etiology shows us something quite important, namely that

⁵³ *Zhen'gao*, 10.11b7–8. Translation from Kleeman, "The Ritualized Treatment of Stroke," 228.

⁵⁴ "When the three *qi*—Wind, Cold, and Damp—all arrive together, they combine and form *bi*-obstruction. When wind *qi* is dominant, it causes moving *bi*; when cold *qi* is dominant, it causes painful *bi*; when damp *qi* is dominant, it causes fixed *bi*." 風寒濕三氣雜至，合而為痺也。其風氣勝者為行痺，寒氣勝者為痛痺，濕氣勝者為著痺也。See *Huangdi neijing Suwen* 黃帝內經素問 (Taipei: Tailian guofeng chubanshe, 1984), 43.328.

the distinction between “moral” and “empirical” remedies does not predict the separate usage of herbs and ritual in practice because these modes of thinking were not considered to be in conflict. The etiology exhibits a rare theoretical self-consciousness about the admixture of classical medicine and ritual theory, reflecting what we have already seen in the treatment regimes prescribed for Liu Zun and Kong Mo. The continuities between the first stage of ritual and the second stage of drug treatment are explained by Yang Xi’s epistemological itinerary, which traverses a broad sweep of domains from which Yang Xi understands disease to come. This syncretic thinking brings together the different kinds of treatment, rather than separating them out. Notably, this example comes from the very text on which Strickmann based his argument, and on which Unschuld tacitly relied, using as he did Strickmann’s earlier, non-medical study.

II. Drugs in Cultivation Regimes

It is important for scholars to consider the degree of “fit” that our modern categories of religion and medicine have with the means by which early actors formed their knowledge, and to tease out more clearly the underpinning logic by which early Chinese actors organized their notions of the world(s) around them. The question that remains to be answered is this: how did the early Shangqing community organize their therapeutic knowledge?

Setting aside the notion that epistemology alone was the primary means for structuring therapeutic knowledge allows us to foreground the *ontology* of drug knowledge. I take a page from Science and Technology Studies (STS) to examine the social structure, means of transmission, and application of that knowledge—the world by, through, and in which such knowledge is created, enacted, and repeated. Examined from this perspective, it becomes apparent that the early Shangqing community took seriously another kind of hierarchy of effectiveness and authority, namely, the difference between esoteric and exoteric drug knowledge. I argue below that this difference was of great importance to the early founders as is shown by the effort devoted to shaping and sustaining it through material, social, technical, textual, and

rhetorical practices. By attending to these, we can come to a clearer understanding of some fundamental organizational principles of Shangqing drug culture.

In looking at the drug recipes described below, we see they were revealed to Shangqing adepts by the ascended instructors of the Xu family, the Perfected. They catered to the adepts' specific physiological needs, and formed part of a long-term program of gradually refined cultivation practices, the ultimate goal of which was to transform the adept into a Perfected. Specific dosages of drugs were not prescribed. Rather, the drugs were to be consumed habitually over long periods of time. In these regimes, curing illness generally came before higher level visualizations.⁵⁵

(a) The Hagiography of Wang Zhongfu

One model for the regime is the story of Wang Zhongfu 王仲甫, a story told expressly for Xu Mi. Despite his long years of practice, Wang was unable to succeed in his goal because of a latent illness. His son, however, achieved transcendence after only eighteen years of cultivation. Lady Wei Huacun 魏華存 then appeared to Wang and told him he could not make spiritual progress until his body healed. He took drugs while continuing his cultivation, and after eighteen years ascended to heaven in broad daylight:

⁵⁵ This is debatable. Xiao Dengfu argues that Shangqing doctrine maintained that prior to taking drugs and cultivating the physical form (*yangxing* 養形), one must first cultivate inner nature (*yangxing* 養性), otherwise the drugs will not take effect. See Xiao Dengfu, "Tao Hongjing *Zhen'gao* zhong suojian xiuzhen zhibing yaofang ji zhongsong guizhu shuo," 1–3. Hsieh Tsung-hui, on the other hand, argues that purging disease followed by fasting from grains were the earliest, most fundamental stages, which once completed led to *yangsheng* and *daoyin* exercises such as we see in the Mawangdui literature. See Hsieh Tsung-hui, "Tao Hongjing *Zhen'gao* yishu zai Zhongguo yiyaoxue shi de gongxian," and "*Zhen'gao* de bencao yiliao guan yanjiu," 3–6. There is not space here to discuss in detail how the sources they use lead them to these different conclusions, however, what is consistent to both papers is the tension between inner and external cultivation, a theme I take up below. Suffice it to say that I think Xiao Dengfu is correct in identifying bodily practice as an initial stage which precedes drug therapy, which in turn precedes visualization. This is the pattern in Xu's own program, in Zhou Ziyang's career, and in the rationale behind the mocking rebuttal of Kong Mo's request for drugs shown above.

The Way of studying Life is that you should first cure [yourself of] diseases, not cause your body to be depleted or possessed by deviants so that the blood is insufficient and cranial matter is lacking, and the saliva is polluted and bodily fluids are torpid. If you don't first cure diseases, then even though you go on diets and circulate *qi*, they will not benefit you. Long ago, there was a Daoist named Wang Zhongfu. Thoughtful as a youth, his favorite activities were those of divine transcendence. He was constantly attracted to the method of the two effulgences (*erjing* 二景) and dining on dew.⁵⁶ After forty years, he perceived no benefit. His son also ingested them, and when he had completed eighteen years, he rose to heaven in broad daylight. Afterwards, the Lady of the Southern Marchmount suddenly descended to Zhongfu and taught him, saying: "Your failure to cross over while alive is because you have a great sickness, your cranial palaces are deficient and leaking, your flesh and fluids do not flow, and you have no excess of spiritual fluids. Even if you absorb the illuminations and dine on dew, that will not cause you any bodily benefit." Zhongfu accordingly took drugs to cure his diseases, and simultaneously cultivated his practice. After another eighteen years, he also ascended to heaven in broad daylight. Now in the Dark Province he has received a written appointment as the Perfected of the Central Marchmount, the Director who commands the nine mysteries.⁵⁷

夫學生之道，當先治病，不使體有虛邪，及血少腦減，津液穢滯也。不先治病，雖服食行炁，無益於身。昔有道士王仲甫者，少乃有意，好事神仙，恆吸引二景飡霞之法。四十餘年，都不覺益，其子亦服之，足一十八年，白日升天。後南嶽真人忽降仲甫而教之云：「子所以不得升度者，以子身有大病，腦宮虧減，筋液不注，靈津未溢，雖復接景飡霞，故未為身益。」仲甫遂因服藥治病，兼修其事，又一十八年，亦白日升天。今在玄州，受書為中嶽真人，領九玄之司。

In the framework of this narrative, illness is not simply an abnormal state that needs rectifying to return one to a stable

⁵⁶ The two effulgences are most commonly the Sun and the Moon, which are usually visualized in the eyes in early visualization practices. See *Zhen'gao*, j. 9 and the early but unclearly dated *Taishang laojun zhongjing* 太上老君中經 (DZ 1168, hereafter as *Laojun zhongjing*).

⁵⁷ *Zhen'gao*, 10.18a9–b6, cited in and punctuation adapted from Xiao Dengfu, "Tao Hongjing *Zhen'gao* zhong suojian xiuzhen zhibing yaofang ji zhongsong guizhu shuo," 4.

equilibrium, as in the exoteric prescriptions above. Here illness is framed as an obstacle to spiritual practice, and a cure as a stage of progress along the path towards an eventual transformation of one's ontological state. Notably, this transformation is marked by the achievement of a title within the spiritual bureaucracy. While previous studies have argued that drugs operated outside the economy of moral debt, one mediated by the spiritual bureaucracy, drugs figure here as an important currency *within* that economy. They have the power to help achieve promotion to much higher ranks, as do the more refined spiritual practices.

(b) Hagiographic Uses of Atractylodes (*Zhu*) as Model for Actual Practice

Hagiographies functioned in multiple ways. They defined lineage and established the frames within which practices were understood. They convinced practitioners and encouraged them to persist on their path. They also transmitted specific practices across generations.⁵⁸

One such secret practice was ingestion of the plant atractylodes (*zhu* 朮). Appearing early on in Shangqing lore, it took a conspicuous place in early hagiographies,⁵⁹ and also in the cultivation regimes of the Xus, as well as receiving extended literary

⁵⁸ On secrecy, reputation, and cultural model-making in hagiography, see Robert Ford Campany, *Making Transcendents: Ascetics and Social Memory in Early Medieval China* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2009). On hagiography as one of the pillars of lineal transmission, Chang Chaojan, "Xipu, jiaofa ji qi zhenghe."

⁵⁹ The most recent scholarship on the formation of the early Shangqing identifies two discrete lines of transmission, one through Zhou Yishan 周義山 and the other through Wei Huacun, by which the major scriptures came into the hands of the Xus. Chang Chaojan, "Xipu, jiaofa ji qi zhenghe," 25–88, 173–251 passim. The Zhou Yishan line traces a genealogy leading from the Green Lad of the Eastern Sea 東海青童 to Juanzi 涓子 to his disciple Su Lin 蘇林, and then to Su Lin's student Zhou Yishan (formally known as Ziyang zhenren 紫陽真人, the Perfected of Purple Solarity). According to Shangqing tradition, Zhou Yishan, together with the Perfected Pei Xuanren 裴玄仁 transmitted their various cultivation methods to Hua Qiao 華僑, the Xus' medium prior to Yang Xi. Hua Qiao had suffered persistent ghostly attacks, moved to the parish (*zhi* 治) of the Xus and converted to Celestial Master Daoism, becoming a priest. See *Ziyang zhenren neizhuan*, 18b and *Zhen'gao*, 20.13b–14a.

attention from one of the senior Perfected in the pantheon. The single most commonly mentioned plant in the *Zhen'gao*, atractylodes was (and still is) widely available on Mao shan. It is one of only three drugs that Tao Hongjing saw fit to describe in his pharmacopoeic text as being available on Mao shan.⁶⁰ It is widely found in transcendent repertoires from the period, and is also noted by Ge Hong as being superior to other drugs.⁶¹

The hagiographic literature portrays a consistent narrative of the drug's role. One of the early predecessors of the Shangqing lineage, Juanzi, tells his disciple Su Lin:

I ate atractylodes essence for three hundred years, ingested *qi* for five hundred years, concentrated my mind for six hundred years, guarded the three ones for three hundred years, guarded the Cavern Chamber for six hundred years, and guarded the Dark Elixir for five hundred years.⁶²

吾餌朮精三百年，服氣五百年，精思六百年，守三一三百年，守洞房六百年，守玄丹五百年。

The hagiography of Su Lin's disciple, Zhou Yishan corroborates the above story about Juanzi.⁶³ It also states that Su Lin went on to

⁶⁰ The others are brown hematite (*yuyuliang* 禹餘糧) and limonite (*shinao* 石腦, also known as *taiyi yuyuliang* 太一禹餘糧). Both are types of iron ore. Tao Hongjing, *Bencao jing jizhu: Jijiao ben* 本草經集注：輯校本, ed. Shang Zhijun 尚志鈞 and Shang Yuansheng 尚元勝 (Beijing: Renmin weisheng chubanshe, 1994).

⁶¹ *Baopuzi neipian jiaoshi*, 11.178. A rich range of sources and information on the drug can be found in Robert Ford Company, *To Live as Long as Heaven and Earth: A Translation and Study of Ge Hong's Traditions of Divine Transcendents* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002), 134n4.

⁶² *Xuanzhou shangqing Su jun zhuan* 玄洲上卿蘇君傳 (hereafter as *Su jun zhuan*), in *Yunji qiqian* 雲笈七籤 (DZ1032, hereafter as *YJQQ*), 104.3a. The date of this hagiography of Su Lin is unclear. It appears that parts of it summarize and build upon *Ziyang zhenren neizhuan*, and together represent a different tradition regarding Juanzi than that on which his earlier hagiography in the *Liexian zhuan* 列仙傳 is based. Portions of the *Su jun zhuan* correspond to the copy in Tao Hongjing's possession, which he cites in *Dengzhen yinju* 登真隱訣 (DZ 421). I follow Chang Chaojan's conclusion that the current edition was likely composed after the Yang-Xu revelations, but before 500. Chang Chaojan, "Xipu, jiaofa ji qi zhenghe," 48–49.

⁶³ The date and best edition of Zhou Yishan's hagiography has also been the subject of debate. Extant editions are *Ziyang zhenren neizhuan*, "Ziyang zhenren

instruct Zhou Yishan on how to use atractylodes to purge the three corpse-worms (*sanshi* 三尸).⁶⁴ If stretching and breathing exercises did not then bear fruit, Zhou was to select from a broad repertoire of herbs. He “imbibed atractylodes for five years [until] his body gave off a glossy sheen, [and then] with penetrating inner vision he saw his five organs” 服食朮五年，身生光澤，徹視內見五藏。⁶⁵ This last excerpt describes three stages in a practice regime. First, Zhou ate the herb. Then, as a result of improved health from taking the herb, his body took on a glossy, shiny appearance. Taking this as a recognizable sign of success in his drug-taking practice, Zhou moved on to practice visualization of the inner organs.⁶⁶ Just like Su Lin before him, once Zhou Yishan had completed his diet of atractylodes, he then went on to develop his inner senses through

Zhou jun neizhuan” 紫陽真人周君內傳, in *YJQQ*, 106.12a–20b, and *Lishi zhenxian tidao tongjian* 歷世真仙體道通鑑 (DZ 296), j. 14. Comparing these, Chang Chaojan argues that *Ziyang zhenren neizhuan* is likely closest among these to the copy in circulation during the Xu’s lifetime (“Xipu, jiaofa ji qi zhenghe,” 25–27, 46). Note that this predates the *Su jun zhuan*, the hagiography of Zhou’s predecessor, Su Lin (see note above), and thus the tradition was being written. Also see Manfred Porkert, *Biographie d’un Taoïste légendaire: Tcheou Tseu-yang* (Paris: Institut des hautes études chinoises, 1979); Isabelle Robinet, *La révélation*, 2:365, 85–86; Livia Kohn, ed., *Daoism Handbook* (Leiden: Brill, 2000), 208; Poul Andersen, *The Method of Holding the Three Ones: A Taoist Manual of Meditation of the Fourth Century A.D.* (London: Curzon Press, 1980), 9–10.

⁶⁴ Literature on the three corpse-worms is extensive. See T. J. Hinrichs, “Medical Transforming of Governance,” 153n90.

⁶⁵ *Ziyang zhenren neizhuan*, 5a. Translation varies from James Miller, *The Way of Highest Clarity: Nature, Vision and Revelation in Medieval China* (Magdalena, NM: Three Pines Press, 2008), 123.

⁶⁶ There is no need to imagine here that atractylodes ingestion was thought to produce a miraculous translucent body that glowed in the dark, or that “inner sight” should be regarded as a mystical, other-worldly experience. Recall Chang Chaojan’s cogent argument that the Shangqing hagiographies were not only abstract models, fables, or attempts to attract patrons or devotees, but structured transmissions of actual practices, intended to be performed by real people and living bodies. Hsieh Tsung-hui and Xiao Dengfu find consistent patterns of distinction between drug ingestion, physical exercises, and visualization, and the order moving from drugs to visualization matches Xiao’s framework. Finally, as Vivienne Lo has shown, tactile awareness of one’s own body was an important means for cultivating health prior to the *Huangdi neijing* innovation, and remained a significant structuring force for later medical thought. The inner visualizations referenced here were contiguous with these therapeutic traditions.

exercise and meditation practice. Once he could visualize his inner organs, he was ready to receive the practice of Guarding the Three Ones (*shou sanyi* 守三一), an important body god visualization practice.

(c) Xu Hui's Cultivation Regime

Both these narratives position atractylodes in a specific, authoritative place within cultivation regimes. At important stages in their regimes, Su Lin and Zhou Yishan, having purged the three worms, strengthened their bodies with atractylodes in order to begin programs of meditation and interior visualization. These narratives also served a clearly pedagogical role in shaping the cultivation of living practitioners. The basic trajectory of the practice series described above appears again in the *Zhen'gao*, where it is prescribed for Xu Hui. His cultivation regime repeats, with variation, those of his predecessors: he should meditate in private, “rectify his *qi*”—implying *yangsheng* exercise, and “not lose it”—implying sexual abstinence.

Jade Knife (Xu Hui),⁶⁷ match up to your destined count, concentrate your mind and abide in the heights;

conceal yourself in silence and sink into retreat, and your correct *qi* will not diminish;

atractylodes powder will cure your disease, it is the right treatment for you.

Vivienne Lo, “The Influence of ‘Yangsheng’ Culture on Early Chinese Medicine” (PhD diss., London: School of Oriental and African Studies, 1998); Vivienne Lo, “Tracking the Pain: *Jue* and the Formation of a Theory of Circulating *Qi* through the Channels,” *Sudhoffs Archiv* 83.2 (1999): 191–211; Vivienne Lo, “The Influence of Nurturing Life Culture on the Development of Western Han Acumoxa Therapy,” in *Innovation in Chinese Medicine*, ed. Elisabeth Hsu (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001), 19–50. External, visual signs of internal bodily or moral states were standardized in many domains by this time. Facial diagnosis was a common diagnostic method in many areas of cultural practice. It is discussed in detail in the *Huangdi neijing* for diagnosing the state of the inner organs. It was used in physiognomy to predict fortune and was also a practice for assessing the inner worth of officials applying for office. See Stephen Bokenkamp, “Simple Twists of Fate: The Daoist Body and Its *Ming*,” 151–65.

⁶⁷ The name “jade knife” 瓊刃, as Tao Hongjing informs us in the annotation to this passage, is a veiled reference to Xu Hui’s stylename “Yufu” 玉斧 (Jade Axe).

Next, eat easy rice (*xunfan* 餽飯),⁶⁸ at the same time, do not deviate by eating grains.

It strengthens the marrow and dispels illness, and will cause your skin and flesh to become full and fat.

Then ascend the mountains, chant the *Cavern [Scripture]* and converse about the abstruse.⁶⁹

瓊刃應數，精心高栖；
 隱嘿沈閑，正氣不虧；
 求散除疾，是爾所宜。
 次服餽飯，兼穀勿違。
 益髓除患，肌膚充肥。
 然後登山，詠洞講微。

Attractylodes is described here as a cure, rather than a purifying/strengthening diet as it was in the previous hagiographies. This cure is followed by another diet, which should produce externally observable changes in Xu Hui's body, as in Zhou Yishan's hagiography. Once this is achieved, Xu Hui will have passed on to the next level of practice and can move to the mountains and chant the *Cavern Scripture*.⁷⁰

(d) Xu Mi's Cultivation Regime: Stone Grease of the Five Dukes (*Wugong shiyu*)

Xu Mi's regime follows the same basic structure as his son's. He is

⁶⁸ This special preparation of black rice and various herbs was a fasting diet, part of a regime to prepare for the avoidance of grains. See below.

⁶⁹ *Zhen'gao*, 2.13b4–14a1.

⁷⁰ This continuity between the hagiographies and Xu Hui's practice proves points argued by Campany and by Chang Chaojan. Campany argues that rather than being simply fictive fantasies, hagiographies were models for actual practice. Robert Campany, *To Live as Long as Heaven*, 98–200. Chang argues that transmission and investiture of authority within a tradition consisted not only of the transmission of scripture and of oral instruction (*koujue* 口訣), but also the reception or composition of sacred biographies (*zhuan* 傳) of previous generations. Chang Chaojan, "Xipu, jiaofa ji qi zhenghe," 275–85. Xu Hui's regime is an oral instruction on how to interpret and apply the knowledge transmitted in the hagiography.

told to align his actions with his spiritual aspirations, quietly meditate, and then take Stone Grease of the Five Dukes (五公石腴).⁷¹ Then he can move on to meditate on bodily effulgences, then astral visualization exercises, and finally the *Great Cavern Scripture*:

Phoenix nesting in lofty boughs, in plain cloth unadorned,⁷²

walk in accordance with your yearning for the Perfected, fix your heart on the mystery of the void.

Stone Grease of the Five Dukes facilitates [acquiring] a new body,
you should quickly take it; it can rejuvenate your complexion.

Illuminate the three sets of eight [effulgences],⁷³ progress through the Dark Perfected in sequence.⁷⁴

⁷¹ The recipe for this grease is not recorded in the *Zhen'gao*, but later Daoist texts include various recipes by a similar name, Five Stone Grease (*wushi yu* 五石腴). The recipe is complex, taking a number of days to prepare, but the basic ingredients are sesame, white honey, allium, cliff water, and 5 pieces of quartz, the size of a bird's egg. Xiao Dengfu notes that it survives elsewhere in the Daoist canon: *Wushang miyao* 無上祕要 (Supreme Secret Essentials, DZ 1138), 87.6b–12b; *Dongzhen gaoshang yudi dadong ciyi yujian wulao baojing* 洞真高上玉帝大洞雌一玉檢五老寶經 (DZ 1313, hereafter as *Ciyi jing*), 3.7a, and YJQO, j. 74 (“Tao Hongjing *Zhen'gao* zhong suojian xiuzhen zhibing yaofang ji zhongsong guizhu shuo,” 1). The same passage describing its powers of rejuvenating the organs after death is found in *Shangqing taishang dijun jiu zhen zhongjing* 上清太上帝君九真中經 (DZ 1376, hereafter as *Jiu zhen zhongjing*), 1.8b–9b, translated in James Miller, *The Way of Highest Clarity*, 191–93. Further variants of the *Ciyi jing* are noted in Isabelle Robinet, *La révélation*, 2:77. This recipe should not be confused with the similarly titled hallucinogen, Five-Stone Powder (*wushi san* 五石散) or its cognate, Cold Food Powder (*hanshi san* 寒食散).

⁷² Tao Hongjing notes that the characters “鳳巢高木，素衣衫然” are code words for Xu Mi's stylename, “Mu” 穆.

⁷³ These were phosphors or effulgences, also known as the Eight Effulgences of the Three Primal Registers (*sanyuan bajing* 三元八景) or of the Three Regions (*sanbu bajing* 三部八景), deities and also points of light corresponding to three regions of the body, eight per region, and also to the twenty-four nodes of the calendar. Methods for meditation are described in the multi-layered *Ciyi jing*, of which some layers date back to the early Shangqing revelations. See Isabelle Robinet, *La révélation*, 2:261–83; Stephen Bokenkamp, “Ershisi sheng tu” 二十四生圖, in *The Encyclopedia of Taoism*, 1:397–98.

⁷⁴ The Gate of the Dark Perfected (Xuanzhen que 玄真闕) is an astral location. *Zhen'gao*, 3.10b5. This phrase appears to refer to a star-stepping exercise (Feibu jing 飛步經).

Unbind the bridle of worldly ties and rest at ease, and then you can intone the *Cavern Scripture*.⁷⁵

鳳巢高木，素衣衫然，
履順思真，凝心虛玄。
五公石腴，彼體所便，
急宜服之，可以少顏。
三八令明，次行玄真，
解駕偃息，可誦洞篇。

Xu Mi later copied out graphic and evocative descriptions of the effects of the grease, which are collected in the *Zhen'gao*.⁷⁶ It was thought to be a powerful rejuvenative, so strong it could bring the dead back to life. They describe the body going into a state of rot and decay, yet remaining in a state of suspended animation. The rotted body, with exposed organs and bones, goes through a slow process of tissue re-growth. The organs regain their lustre, contain their fluids, and are eventually covered over again by the skin, producing a new refreshed body, after having gone through the process of death and partial decay:

If one has temporarily died and gone to Great Yin, and briefly passed over to the Three Officials, the flesh will then rot and decay, the blood will sink and the pulse will become scattered.⁷⁷ However, the five organs [remain] alive independently, the white bones [remain] like jade, the seven whitesouls supply and attend to them, the three cloudsouls guard the mansion, the three primes rest for a time, and the Great Spirit will be enclosed within.

⁷⁵ *Zhen'gao*, 2.13b4–7.

⁷⁶ *Zhen'gao*, 4.16a–b. Tao Hongjing attributes Xu Mi's sources as the *Jiuzhen jing* 九真經 (Scripture of the Nine Perfected). However these passages do not survive in extant versions of the scripture. Thomas E. Smith, trans., *Declarations of the Perfected*, 303n245. On these scriptures, see Isabelle Robinet, *La révélation*, 2:67–83.

⁷⁷ These are pulse descriptions, attested to from the earliest classical medical literature, the *Huangdi neijing*, where they are mentioned in numerous discussions. The sinking of blood refers to the Sinking Pulse (*chenmai* 沉脈)—this generally indicates deep, internal disorders and deficiency. The Scattered Pulse (*sanmai* 散脈) is similarly a sign of deficiency, sometimes associated with the kidneys.

Whether in thirty, twenty, ten, or three years, they come out by their own will. When they are about to come to life, then they again receive blood and regenerate the flesh, produce saliva and form bodily fluids, renewing these materials to achieve a bodily form. They achieve an appearance superior to the one from long ago before they died.⁷⁸

若其人斃死，適太陰，權過三官者，肉既灰爛，血沉脉散者，而猶五藏自生，白骨如玉，七魄營侍，三魂守宅，三元權息，太神內閉。或三十年、二十年，或十年、三年，隨意而出。當生之時，即更收血育肉，生津成液，復質成形，乃勝於昔未死之容也。

The drug is depicted as a miraculous resuscitant of the corpses of those who have crossed over, enabling their inhabitants to take them up once again. Yet despite the supernatural depictions available to Xu Mi through scriptural sources, the application in his regimen was as a humble health tonic, designed to restore Xu Mi to his youthful vigor. Its dramatic and supernatural effects did not prevent Five Stone Grease from being used as a humble rejuvenant. Put another way, these fantastic depictions can be read as rhetorical devices to promote a drug with more humble uses.

We can learn from this two things. Firstly, that the drugs described in the dramatic and evocative language of Daoist scriptures are not always as outlandish as they may first appear. Very exotic depictions may belie quite mundane therapeutic materials. Secondly, in the context of esoteric transmission, illness events, cures, and the seeking of health take on a wholly different level of significance, wherein they are understood in relation to the overarching goal of salvation. This is true not only in Xu Mi's case, but also in those of Wang Zhongfu and Xu Hui.

III. Situated Knowing: Practice, Community, and Knowledge

Yang Xi's hybrid etiology, which closed the first section of this paper, reflects patterns of syncretic writing common in early Imperial China—not just those well attested in the study of Chinese

⁷⁸ *Zhen'gao*, 4.16a5–10.

religions,⁷⁹ but medical syncretism, about which much less has been written. Tracing the origins of disease through the damp in the tomb, Tao Kedou's plaint, the Earth Officer, the curse, and Xu Mi's body, the etiology connects multiple domains of technical expertise: geomancy, sepulchral plaints, the celestial bureaucracy, ritual cursing and prayer, and bodily physiology.

Yang Xi's etiology also functions as an argument. It demonstrates the command that the Perfected have over knowledge of all these domains and their ability to deal with troubles from any and all of them. This kind of construction is a deliberate move that positions Yang Xi and the knowledge of the Perfected in relation to other stakeholders in the competition of technical knowledge and skills.⁸⁰ It asserts that not only are Yang and the Perfected capable of dealing with each and all of these different skills, but that the elevated position of the Shangqing heaven and its denizens affords a supreme overview, a unifying epistemic perspective which can account for the interconnections between all these disparate forms of knowledge.

The fluid simplicity with which Yang Xi cuts across "moral" and "empirical" modes of operation suggests that these were not predominant concerns for Yang Xi or the Xus. The fact that the habitual combination of drugs and ritual passes *sans fanfare*, without reference to other practitioners or communities, suggests that it was not a driving concern in the wider community either. The oft-cited Celestial Master prohibitions of needles, moxa, and drugs by the ritualist Lu Xiuqing 陸修靜 (406–477) and others,

⁷⁹ Robert Ford Campany, "On the Very Idea of Religions (in the Modern West and in Early Medieval China)," *History of Religions* 42.4 (2003): 287–319; Robert Ford Campany, "Religious Repertoires and Contestation: A Case Study Based on Buddhist Miracle Tales," *History of Religions* 52.2 (2012): 99–141; Christine Mollier, *Buddhism and Taoism Face to Face: Scripture, Ritual, and Iconographic Exchange in Medieval China* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2008).

⁸⁰ A similar argument, which maintains that texts should not be read solely in terms of their diachronic relations to other writings in the same genre, but should also be read as attempts to position their legitimacy within contemporary debates, was made cogently in Michael J. Puett, *To Become a God: Cosmology, Sacrifice, and Self-Divinization in Early China* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 2002).

come rather late in the day in the 5th century, thus postdating the Shangqing revelations.⁸¹

At this time medical plurality was a growing concern as the church sought to reestablish its primacy as a ritual core for its adherents. These prohibitions should be read in the light of this context, and not as universally applicable.⁸²

Unschuld understood material efficacy to be an exclusive feature of Daoist (*sic*, read Transcendent) knowledge which separated them from Celestial Master and Taiping Daoists who relied on moral/spiritual efficacy. Yet it is clear that the Shangqing community used both without problem—such a dichotomy was simply not relevant to them.⁸³ Strickmann allowed that the same people might use both practices, but that they couldn't be used to

⁸¹ *Santian neijie jing* 三天內解經 (DZ 1205), 1.6b; *Lu xiansheng daomen kelue* 陸先生道門科略 (DZ 1127), 8a. Even Lu Xiuqing's position may not have been fixed, since in the same text he appears to allow for medical treatment, after which one can then resort to ritual. He says: "If those with acute and chronic illness are not successful with decoctions, medicine, and moxa and they solely ingest [whole] talismans or drink [them in] water, and confess the faults and transgressions since the year of their birth, then even those whose faults should be met with death will be completely forgiven. As for those with co-morbid illnesses or who are stuck with chronic conditions, none will live out their full [count of life]" 若疾病之人不勝湯藥針灸，惟服符飲水，及首生年以來所犯罪過，罪應死者皆為原赦。積疾困病，莫不生全 (*Lu xiansheng daomen kelue*, 1b–2a). Translation follows reading of this passage in Lin Fu-shih, *Zongjiao yu yiliao*, 306–307. Lin argues that by allowing limited use of medicine in this passage, Lu Xiuqing contradicts the complete prohibition in the *Daomen kelue* passage cited in the previous note. Lin acknowledges that this contradictory reading of the passage here may have been produced by a miscopy of the character “不” (n14). If the latter passage is as it stands, and as Lin reads it, then it advocates treating the same patient and disease with ritual confession and with drugs, moxa, and needles. This is just as we see in the *Zhen'gao*, albeit in reverse order.

⁸² There are, to be sure, numerous other places where the distinction between ritual and material treatments are made, but studies to date have treated these distinctions as epistemic generalities, and have not unpacked how they were used to structure local, contemporary relationships. Examples include Ge Hong, *Baopuzi neipian jiaoshi*, 9.156 and Tao Hongjing, *Bencao jing jizhu*, xu 序, 15–16. The latter passage is discussed without reference to the positioning work it performs in Li Jianmin, “They shall Expel Demons.” Preliminary analysis of this passage is in Michael Stanley-Baker, “Daoists and Doctors,” 151–54.

⁸³ Unschuld also argues that acupuncture and drugs were not used in combination because they relied on different conceptual systems that were intrinsically bound to incompatible social values. He used these to distinguish between Daoists and

treat the same disease.⁸⁴ This assumes that the modes of thinking attendant on these practices were conceptually incommensurable, and thus incompatible. Yet we see in the *Zhen'gao*, and Lu Xiuqing's description of hybrid treatment, that this was not the case. Such incommensurability was not universally recognized, nor did it prevent combination of practices.

The circulation of practices across domains calls for some methodological reflection, better means to account for their multivalence.⁸⁵ It is not feasible to imagine culture, knowledge, and community as rigid structures fixed to ideological foundations. Such a structural approach imagines a correlation between epistemology and social structure, giving preponderance to the former. At its heart lies a misapprehension of "epistemology," that is, intellectual notions, as "ontology," that is, the complex assemblages of people, things, ideas, texts, relations, environment, gods, weather, politics, war, and other multifarious factors through which knowledge becomes stable in a historical moment.⁸⁶ Together these form the arena and medium in which ideas are born, embodied, played out, used, discarded developed, resisted, and transformed.

Doctors. Yet the *Zhen'gao* and Lu Xiuqing's statement above indicate that these two practices were commonly used together, as does the all-too-common habit of referring to acupuncture, moxa, and drugs in the same breath.

⁸⁴ Michel Strickmann, *Chinese Magical Medicine*, 49.

⁸⁵ The move to foreground practices as a means to unpack religious identity is well articulated in Campano, "On the Very Idea of Religions" and "Religious Repertoires and Contestation." On the term "practice communities" and the application of this notion to trace the formation of Daoism, see Gil Raz, *The Emergence of Daoism: Creation of Tradition* (London: Routledge, 2012), 4–6. On the broader history of the practice turn, William H. Sewell, "The Concept(s) of Culture," in *Beyond the Cultural Turn: New Directions in the Study of Society and Culture*, ed. Victoria Bonnell and Lynn Avery Hunt (Berkeley, Calif.: University of California Press, 1999), 35–61.

⁸⁶ The early predecessor of Science and Technology Studies, Ludwik Fleck, fought his own battles against epistemologists of his time (i.e., the Vienna School) by arguing that the social structures, communities, and practices by which knowledge is produced, sustained, and reproduced constitute the locus of an epistemology, and they cannot be separated from its history. He coined the term thought-style, or *denkstyl*, to refer to characteristic ways of thinking common to specific epistemic communities. Ludwik Fleck, *Genesis and Development of a Scientific Fact* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1935 [1981]). Bruno Latour, drawing on his work to refine his own notions of ontology, argued that

Recognizing the complexity of how knowledge is formed in-the-world constitutes a shift away from a representational understanding of knowledge to a relational one. That is, it sets aside an understanding of knowledge as an abstract, albeit imperfect, representation of the world held in the subjective (Cartesian) consciousness of “knowers,” and with which scientists make their best attempts to guide their practice. Rather, it understands knowledge to be a processual engagement with the world that is constantly lived out, changing, and newly represented and formed. In this analytic, practices do not *intrinsically* possess properties which restrict them to a given thought style or community. Rather, they are imbued with this quality under specific conditions, when wielded as rhetorical tools, usually in contexts of encounter, comparison, and competition. In these contexts, practices become used to shore up a community’s self-identity and establish polemical relationships or alliances with other stakeholders in the knowledge marketplace.

Thus, rather than asserting that a given practice is intrinsic to a community, or a specific thought-style, it is more productive to inquire *at which point* these practices are used to define identity, and the conditions under which they become so used. Rather than assuming that medicine is somehow intrinsically different from religion, it is preferable to unpack the specific historical moments and conditions when such distinctions arose, and the roles certain practices, terms, and ideas played in that difference-making. In this model practices are “interested,” that is, they intersect into a given historical moment from a specific positionality, representing, engaging with, and producing the world in particular ways relevant to the practitioners who perform them. Knowledge is “positional” or “situated”—it articulates actors in particular relationships and

knowledge is not representational, but relational—it exists in the relations between people and things, along the networks of exchange. Bruno Latour, “A Textbook Case Revisited: Knowledge as Mode of Existence,” in *The Handbook of Science and Technology Studies*, ed. E. J. Hackett et al. (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2007), 83–112. For a brief, similar discussion of the misapprehension of epistemology for the history of scientific assemblages, see Bruno Latour, “Can We Get Our Materialism Back, Please?,” *Isis* 98.1 (2007): 138–42.

perspectives within their larger environment.⁸⁷ We see this in how the overarching goals or plans of the esoteric cultivation regimes structurally separate them from the exoteric curative prescriptions. This situatedness of knowing is locally specific, and involves direct relationships that are personal, institutional, political, epistemic, and imbued with power. Situated knowledge is more historically specific than the notion of “cultural manifold,” which articulates a broad-level, culture wide set of relations, and is given to narratives of macro-history.⁸⁸ Situated knowing privileges micro-history, and attempts to articulate individual actors into the larger trajectories of macro-history by working from the ground up.

IV. Dual Destinies

A situated understanding of knowledge allows for surprises to emerge.⁸⁹ In the case of the early members of the Shangqing community, we have found two. First, as discussed above, we discover that drugs and ritual were not mutually exclusive practices, and nor were the thought styles (moral versus empirical) in which those practices were imbricated. Secondly, by attending to the means by which knowledge circulated, the forms it took, and the social relations it was involved in, we discover an epistemic distinction not described in the text, but inscribed in social practice. This distinction is between two different notions of, relationships to and plans for dealing with destiny.

⁸⁷ The term “situated knowledge” has a history dating at least to the influential article by Donna Haraway, “Situated Knowledges: The Science Question in Feminism and the Privilege of Partial Perspective,” *Feminist Studies* 14.3 (1988): 575–99. This article foregrounded the role of women scholars, technicians, and scientists in the production of knowledge in what was a fairly male-dominated field. My usage here is closer to Latour’s notion of ontology (see note above), but foregrounds the agency of human actors and power within their networks.

⁸⁸ The indivisibility of knowledge from culture was first given the term “cultural manifold” in *The Way and the Word: Science and Medicine in Early China and Greece*, ed. Geoffrey Lloyd and Nathan Sivin (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2002), xiff., and has since been taken up in numerous publications.

⁸⁹ On surprise and not taking social categories for granted, Bruno Latour, *Reassembling the Social: An Introduction to Actor-Network-Theory* (Oxford; New York: Oxford University Press, 2005), 1–17 passim.

This distinction separates two different flows of therapeutic knowledge, two different modes of transmission and two different conceptions of disease and cure. The esoteric recipes were directly revealed to initiates as part of long-term regimes or programs that the recipients should practice themselves. These recipes were reinforced by appearing in multiple hagiographies of the Shangqing genealogy, and were not available in vernacular literature. Their end goal was to transform the recipients' bodily and spiritual status, to produce a fundamental ontological shift in the practitioner's being. From this perspective, disease itself was imbued with very specific meanings—it marked the sick person at a beginner's level of spiritual progress, could be taken as a spiritual test along the way, or as evidence of a person's lack of devotion to the path. Destiny here is something to be changed, fundamentally, by one's endeavors.

The exoteric recipes were revealed to non-initiates. Treatments were mediated by rituals performed by Yang Xi and Xu Mi, and appeared in vernacular medical literature in wide circulation, but not in sacred scriptures or hagiographies. The end goal was to restore the body and individual to good relations with the bureaucratic pantheon and to good health. Treatments did not entail a radical shift in body and spirit, but a return to the norm. They were a one-off set of responses to an idiosyncratic problem, not part of a larger program. Disease in this context was often not seen as a result of sepulchral plights, the operations of the unquiet dead, but instead signified impaired relations that needed to be restored rather than radically reshaped. It did not mark one's level of spiritual cultivation. Destiny here is something that can be tweaked, by others or by oneself, with the aid of the spiritual bureaucracy *and* with drugs.

Destiny then, and the operations by which one deals with it, emerges as twofold—one can engage with it at the micro-level to navigate the idiosyncrasies of daily life, or one can attempt radical change. This distinction is not expressly described in such a way that we can cite a passage, but it is palpable through its situatedness: through the ways it vectors knowledge, community, and practice differently. Access to knowledge about radical self-transformation is bound up in position-making practices that define

the knowers within their wider set of relations, including their progress on the path, their membership of the initiate community, their good standing with the Perfected whom they also aspire to become, their genealogical relationship to the subjects of hagiography in which the practices are transmitted, and their connectedness to the Mao mountains and the plants that grow on it. Performing the practices further embodies those relations, it marks one's body and conditions one's physical experience with that relatedness.⁹⁰

By shifting our notions of what knowledge is and how it is constituted, and by not privileging historiographic categories like "medicine" and "religion," we can have access to this distinction and how it fundamentally shaped the lives of the early Shangqing members. It emerges that distinctions between "empirical" and "moral/spiritual" etiologies held little force for Shangqing members. Notably, this distinction is closer to the modern thought-styles of "science" and "religion" that have had defining force on our own daily lives, on institutional practices and relations, and on the histories of how we have produced scholarship on China. I humbly suggest that by reappraising how it is we think we know, we may be better equipped to account for how people did so in the past.

⁹⁰ On sensory synesthesia and the blending of therapy and salvation in Shangqing practices, Michael Stanley-Baker, "Palpable Access to the Divine: Daoist Medieval Massage, Visualisation and Internal Sensation," *Asian Medicine* 7 (2012): 101–127.

反思藥物、命和病理學與中國中古道教： 知識的情景轉變

徐源

摘要

長久以來，人們認為謝罪儀式和藥物治療建基於不同的理論基礎之上，因此這兩種治療法是無可相容或互相配用的，而四世紀的《真誥》誥文就是持上述觀點之人的重要資源。但細查《真誥》時，我們發現其實藥物和儀式治療經常被用於一個治療體系。其中的啟示者，祭酒楊羲在啟示病因理論的同時，也介紹配用儀式和藥物治療的可能性。因此，這值得我們從這些當時人物的角度，重新審視宗教和醫藥分離的歷史論述。

如果《真誥》中的人物不是從宗教和醫學的角度組織他們的治療知識，那麼他們採用了甚麼方法？從他們本身的社會體制結構中的知識循環和分等，就能看到最大的分別在於明傳和秘傳知識，它們有著截然不同的傳授方式、治療概念、醫學文化和病原論。此兩種知識之間的區分並不在於宗教或醫學的差異，而是對「命」的兩種不同潛在觀念，同時影響著「改命」的方法和範圍。

關鍵詞：上清、醫學、宗教、藥物、命運