

高郵王氏四種成因探析

(提要)

虞萬里

高郵王氏四種名著成書二百年來，研究專著與論文無數，但多著眼於單本著作之訓詁、文法、考據等，未能全面觀照。茲從王氏父子仕履行歷、學術思想發展與四種著作成因及撰作先後之視角切入，結合二王群經諸子校本、四種著作稿本和初、二、三刻刊本之互相關聯條目，揭示其內在脈絡。《廣雅疏證》雖較《讀書雜誌》、《經義述聞》、《經傳釋詞》先成，但在疏證《廣雅》同時，已撰有《雜誌》、《述聞》、《釋詞》部分條目。及其完成《廣雅疏證》後傾力於三書撰作，許多關聯條目也是同時撰寫，不斷積累，因而《述聞》有初、二、三刻。及至王念孫晚年，始將《讀書雜誌》逐一定稿刻成。至於王國維、劉盼遂所創王引之條目多為乃父歸美之說，衍生到後來，成為所題王引之撰述之《述聞》和《釋詞》皆乃父之著，引之是官高才拙坐享其名。今援據學界未曾關注的乾隆五十五年前王引之致乃父論學家書和乾隆六十年順天鄉試策問，證明王引之深於六書訓詁，完全有能力撰述書中條目，當年王念孫朋輩之稱讚並非虛譽；指出王念孫既有發明權又有著作權，王引之則自有其著作權，由此可以平息近百年來關於王氏父子著作權公案之爭論。

關鍵詞： 王氏四種 稿本刻本 四書關聯 著作成因 著作權爭論

A Study of the Circumstances behind the Writing of the “Four Books of Wang Niansun and Wang Yinzhi”

(Abstract)

Yu Wanli

Extensive research has been published since the “Four Books of Wang Niansun and Wang Yinzhi” were finished 200 years ago. Those studies focus on individual aspects of exegesis, grammar, and textual criticism, but lack a comprehensive view. This paper will reveal the circumstances and processes behind their composition from the perspectives of Wangs’ experience, the development of academic thoughts, and the order of the books’ completion. The research was based on several versions and editions of Wangs’ works. Although Wang Niansun finished *Guangya shuzheng* before *Dushu zazhi*, *Jingyi shuwen*, and *Jing zhuan shici*, he had written parts of the other three books when *Guangya shuzheng* was under way. After *Guangya shuzheng* was completed, similar entries of the other three books were written and revised at the same time. That was the reason why *Jingyi shuwen* had undergone three editions. It was not until Wang Niansun’s later years that he the final version of *Dushu zazhi* was eventually put into print. Wang Guowei and Liu Pansui’s statement that Wang Yinzhi’s entries were actually his father’s work has somehow developed into the formulation that *Jingyi shuwen* and *Jing zhuan shici* were also Wang Niansun’s works. According to Wang Yinzhi’s letter to his father in 1790 and his performance in the national examinations in 1795—neither of which has received much attention in the academia, Wang Yinzhi was quite capable of writing the two books and the praises Wang Niansun’s friends had for Wang Yinzhi were real. Wang Niansun had both the right of invention and authorship, while Wang Yinzhi also owned his part of the authorship. And thus, the authorship dispute regarding Wang Niansun and Wang Yinzhi over the past century has been resolved.

Keywords: “Four Books of Wangs” manuscripts and printed editions
relationship among the Four Books
circumstances behind the books’ composition authorship disputes